# Table of Contents

Abbreviations and Acronyms ii  
Executive Summary iii  

## 1 INTRODUCTION  
1.1 Overview of the Policy Context 1  
1.2 Background to the National Programme for Councillors Training 2  
1.3 Background to the Training Impact Evaluation (TIE) 3  

## 2 TIE APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY 4  
2.1 Preparation and Orientation 4  
2.2 Data Collection 4  
2.3 Analysis and Reporting 5  
2.4 Feedback and Reflection 6  
2.5 Process Challenges and Mitigation 6  
2.6 The team and acknowledgement 8  

## 3 PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS 9  
3.1 Analysis of the Pre-Training Activities 9  
3.1.1 Capacity needs assessment process 9  
3.1.2 Capacity Needs Identified 10  
3.2 Analysis of the Scope and Training Processes 11  
3.2.1 Content issues 11  
3.2.2 Process/Mechanics issues 14  
3.2.3 Organisational and logistical support 22  
3.3 Analysis of Impact on Individual Learning 24  
3.3.1 Analysis of objectives 24  
3.3.2 Analysis of the acquisition of knowledge and skills 24  
3.4 Impact on Job Behaviour, Organisation and Human Settlements 25  
3.4.1 Adherence to legal provisions and procedures 25  
3.4.2 Roles and responsibilities in relation to leadership and management 27  
3.4.3 Role of councillors in service delivery 31  
3.4.4 Roles in management and control of LG finances 31  
3.4.5 Crosscutting Issues 32  

## 4 SUMMARY OF LESSONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS 35  
4.1 Improving the Next Round of Councillor Training in Tanzania 35  
4.2 Institutionalising Training: Lessons from the Councillors Training 38  
4.3 Overall Assessment 41  
Annex 1: References 42  
Annex 2: The Work Plan 44  
Annex 3: Sampled Local Government Authorities and the Sampling Criteria 45  
Annex 4: List of People Met 47  
Annex 5: Terms of Reference 52  
Annex 6: TIE methodology and tools/questionnaires: 57
## Abbreviations and Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALAT</td>
<td>Association of Local Authorities in Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBG</td>
<td>Capacity Building Grant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBO</td>
<td>Community Based Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCM</td>
<td>Chama Cha Mapinduzi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLP</td>
<td>Council Link Person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil society Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DANIDA</td>
<td>Danish International Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DC</td>
<td>District Commissioner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCI</td>
<td>Development Cooperation Ireland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPs</td>
<td>Development Partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPU</td>
<td>Development Planning Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRDP</td>
<td>District Rural Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FINNIDA</td>
<td>Finnish Agency for Development Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOT</td>
<td>Government of Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KII</td>
<td>Key Informant Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGAs</td>
<td>Local Government Authorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGCDBG</td>
<td>Local Government Capital Development Grant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGRP</td>
<td>Local Government Reform Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MC</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Government Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORAD</td>
<td>Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMO-RALG</td>
<td>Prime Minister’s Office - Regional Administration &amp; Local Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROG</td>
<td>Regional Oversight Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTs</td>
<td>Regional Trainers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAEU</td>
<td>Southern Africa Extension Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIDA</td>
<td>Swedish International Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNV</td>
<td>Netherlands Development Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCBB</td>
<td>Training and Capacity Building Branch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIE</td>
<td>Training Impact Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIP</td>
<td>Training Impact on Performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ToR</td>
<td>Terms of Reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSh</td>
<td>Tanzanian Shillings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSs</td>
<td>Training Specialists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN-HABITAT</td>
<td>United Nations Human Settlements Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VEO</td>
<td>Village Executive Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WDC</td>
<td>Ward Development Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEO</td>
<td>Ward Executive Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZRT</td>
<td>Zonal Regional Team</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive Summary

Background

UN-HABITAT together with the Local Government Reform Programme (LGRP) commissioned the assignment "to conduct an impact evaluation of the National Programme for Councillors Training, undertaken by the Government of Tanzania (GoT) through the Prime Minister’s Office – Regional Administration and Local Government (PMO-RALG) in 2003/4.

The Training Impact Evaluation TIE was conducted through a highly participatory process consulting stakeholders at the national, regional, council, ward as well as community levels. It covered Karatu, Kibaha, Magu and Monduli district councils and Ilala, Mtwara-Mikindani municipal councils and Mwanza City Council.

While the TIE team strived to take into account several diversity dimensions including levels of education, urban/rural differentials, different status of local authorities (urban and rural; urban municipal or city councils), age, gender, ethnicity, spatial location vis-à-vis Dar-es-salaam, political dominance (CCM or multi-partyism) etc these had little effect on the findings. This is the same conclusion that the team that undertook the assessment, prepared the training materials, tested them etc reached i.e. that there was no significant differences to warrant different training approaches, thus adopting a standardised and phased out national training programme.

Key findings and recommendations

a) Process findings and recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Key Findings</th>
<th>Key Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Capacity needs assessment</td>
<td>• The process was consultative and comprehensive</td>
<td>• The scope of training should generally be maintained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The needs identified were relevant, exhaustive &amp; built on previous experiences</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Training materials</td>
<td>• Materials were relevant to address the identified knowledge and skills needs</td>
<td>• General modules should be maintained but reviewed for consistency with policy and practice as well as detail especially for financial management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Some aspects of some of the modules were either overtaken by policy and legislative changes or out of step with practice (e.g. aspects related to procurement)</td>
<td>• This will require comprehensive editing of the existing modules and preparation of addenda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Prepare a grand summary module (also see 5)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 3. Trainers | • Trainers were reported competent for facilitating adult learners  
  • Trainers lacked depth in financial management issues | • Review case by case and as far as practical maintain the same training staff  
  • Ensure adequate presence of financial management expertise;  
  • Plan progressive sharing particularly on adoption of methods |
|---|---|---|
| 4. Training methods and strategy | • The mix of plenary and group discussions coupled with case studies greatly contributed to the acquisition of both the knowledge and skills aspects of the training;  
  • The mix of residential and distance learning strategies was also conducive for adult learning  
  • However, distance learning was less effective as most of the councillors did not use the time allocated for it | • Maintain the mix of both methods and strategies;  
  • Enhance the use of case studies and role plays;  
  • Elicit interest and commitment for distance learning through closer follow-ups by CLPs and RTs (like recaps during council sessions)  
  • Encourage the councils to complement the national councillors’ training with other strategies like targeted exposure visits using say the CBG |
| 5. The Target Group | • Mixing of female and male councillors was beneficial | • Target newly elected councillors plus the 24 that joined at module 4 stage for all modules  
  • Combine new with continuing councillors at the end as recap and refresher programme respectively  
  • Encourage tailored joint in-house training sessions between councillors and council staff to complement the national programme |
| 6. Attendance and participation | • Reported high turn-out as well as active participation in the training sessions | • Maintain the political profile, course delivery methods as well logistical support to maintain attendance and participation |
| 7. Training duration | • Training duration for residential sessions was reported to be very tight especially because councillors did not effectively use the time allocated for distance learning | • Maintain the duration but ensure effective use of time allocated particularly during distance learning (see 4 above) |
| 8. Timing and training schedules | • There was overwhelming and unanimous agreement that the delivery of the training was too late; | • Next round of training be delivered within 2006  
  • Subsequent training should be planned in advance and conducted immediately after elections |
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|9. | Training venues | • Training venues varied from council to council;  
• Generally conducive for adult learning  
• There were reservations regarding location vis-à-vis councillor residences and offices |
|   |   | • Continue with the model of central accommodation;  
• Involve the councillors in the selection of the venue so long as it is within price ceiling;  
• Where practical, selected venue should be outside councils |
|10. | Backstopping and quality control | • Quality control arrangements through SAEU and LGRP were sufficient |
|   |   | • Maintain the quality control and backstopping arrangements  
• Ensure more active involvement of ALAT for future institutionalisation of the training |
|11. | Administrative and logistical oversight | • The ROG, council directors and CLP did not provide sufficient support to the training process as anticipated  
• MMOs played insignificant roles in training. |
|   |   | • Further clarify and provide roles and responsibilities for the ROG, council directors and CLPs  
• Incorporate these roles in respective job schedules  
• Capacitated and empowered MMOs will play a central role in institutionalizing training and capacity building endeavours in LAs.\(^2\) |
|12. | Logistical and administrative issues | • Councillors reported to have been given allowances in addition to accommodation and meals (apart from dinner)\(^3\) |
|   |   | • Maintain the structure and rate of the allowances at real value. |
|13 | Monitoring and Evaluation | • Monitoring conducted to establish acquisition of knowledge and skills by the RTs and SAEU;  
• However there were difficulties in monitoring the application of the skills after the training;  
• Challenges in determining the overall attainment of objectives as they were neither clearly stated nor disseminated.  
• Overall there is no robust M&E system |
|   |   | • Clearly determine and state the hierarchy of objectives, including quantitatively verifiable indicators, means of verifications and assumptions  
• Ensure that the training process is monitored at all levels i.e. pre-training, during and immediately after the training, how the councillors are performing on the job and how the councillors performance is contributing to the overall attainment of the councils’ mandates  
• Ensure linkage to and integration with the other M&E systems in the country. |

---

1 Distance learning in the context of the Tanzania National Programme for Councillors Training and therefore under this TIE refers to self study undertaken by the councillors in between the residential sessions. It does not refer to the commonly used internet/e-based learning.

2 Explore the possibility of enhancing the roles of MMOs in this regard.

3 One of the suggestions made in order to maintain this profile is to get either the President or the Prime Minister to announce that “a national training programme for councillors” is going to take place and that councillors are expected to contribute to its cost.
b) Acquisition of knowledge and skills and impact on job performance and organisational effectiveness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Functional area</th>
<th>Key changes in job performance and impact on organisation and human settlements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Adherence to legal provisions and procedures</td>
<td>• Improved adherence to council meeting procedures manifested among other things by sufficient prior preparations leading to shorter meeting durations;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Exhibited collective responsibility and team work noticeable in joint implementation of projects across wards and limited contradictions in council meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Improved councillors’ work organisation has significantly reduced the ad hoc visits to council offices allowing staff to concentrate on their tasks;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Improved adherence to guidelines and code of conduct. There are reduced cases of violating guidelines leading to improved public image of councillors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Roles and responsibilities in relation to leadership and management</td>
<td>• The roles of councillors have been clarified and hence they know the boundaries of their authority;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• There is explicit cordial working relationship and reduced confrontation between councillors and staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Harmonious relationship between the councillors and WDC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Notwithstanding some councils, there is improved understanding of working procedures under a multi-party system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Improved performance of the legislative function manifested by the councils passing bye-laws</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Improved downward accountability to constituents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Increased appreciation of the demands of the councillors roles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Roles of Councillors in service delivery</td>
<td>• The councillors performance and participation in council development activities has improved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The councillors mobilize community members to participate in planning, implementation, management and monitoring of social and economic projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Roles in management and control of LG finances</td>
<td>• The councillors now participate in local revenue mobilisation. They identify sources of revenue, participate in mobilisation of revenue collection and oversee revenue administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• They are also vigilant in overseeing councils expenditure which has led to improvement in financial management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• But there are still gaps in scrutinizing council budgets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Crosscutting Issues</td>
<td>• There is improved gender mainstreaming as for example the female councillors express themselves better and address issues that affect both females and males;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Even the councillors not re-elected were found to be using the skills acquired through for example guiding village and mtaa meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The incentive based grant allocation system where councils have to meet a set of criteria before they access funds has been a stimulant for the councillors to mount pressure to council staff for improved performance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Overall Assessment**

The national programme for councillors training faced some systemic challenges especially the absence of clear objectives and monitoring framework. In addition, there were operational challenges notably the delays faced during the delivery stage.

The above notwithstanding, the preparation and delivery process were generally sound. As a result, the training was able to greatly contribute towards the improved performance of the councillors and the councils’ attainment of their mandates. The TIE team therefore concluded that the training was an investment worth making.

It is therefore recommended that the training should be provided to the newly elected councillors and those that joined at module 4 stage in the previous councillors’ training. For continuing councillors, a fast tracked refresher module should be provided jointly with the new councillors at the end of the next round of training. The training processes and outputs should further be institutionalised through mainstreaming them with the respective council human resource development plans and budgets. Enhanced roles of MMOs and ALAT in future training programmes should be explored and their capacities to undertake the same built. All the plans should be effectively disseminated at all levels and on a regular basis.
1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Overview of the Policy Context

a) Broad political commitment

In 1999, the Tanzania Development Vision 2025 was launched with an aspiration for Tanzania to develop from a ‘least developed country’ to a ‘middle income country’ by the year 2025 with a high level of human development. It is envisaged that Tanzania should be imbued with five attributes: high quality livelihood; peace, stability and unity; good governance; a well educated and learning society; and a competitive economy capable of producing sustainable growth and shared benefits. The Vision also emphasizes the need for empowering local governments and communities and promoting broad based grassroots participation in the mobilisation of resources, knowledge and experience with a view to stimulating initiatives at all levels of society.

In addition, section 145 of the Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania provides for the establishment of local government authorities while section 146 further stipulates that the purpose of having local government authorities is to transfer authority to the people. It stipulates that the objective of having local government is to enhance the democratic process within its area of jurisdiction and to apply the democracy for facilitating the expeditious and faster development of the people.

Cognizant of the aspirations of Vision 2025 and the Constitution, the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP) – in Swahili known as MKUKUTA - among other things calls for the institutionalization of the principles of good governance, rule of law, accountability and democracy.

b) Commitment to Local Government (LG) reforms

The Government is committed to the strengthening of Local Government Authorities (LGAs) on two prongs. On one hand as a means of improving local democracy, decision making, popular participation, transparency and accountability and on the other to improve the efficiency in the delivery and management of basic services. In particular, the 1998 Policy Paper on Local Government Reform that outlines the Government’s decentralisation policy stipulates four main areas of policy reform one of which is political decentralisation.

Political decentralisation among other things makes the councils the most important local, political body within their jurisdiction and implies the creation of real, multifunctional governments at the local level within the framework of the national legislation. The Local Government Reform Programme (LGRP) was launched in 1999 as the main vehicle of implementing the Government’s decentralisation policy.
The current government is further emphasizing the devolution of powers to LGAs and even urging the LGAs to implement their mandates at faster pace as demonstrated by the slogan “Ari Mpya, Nguvu Mpya, Kasi Mpya” meaning new vigour, new strength and faster speed.

c) Financing of LG reforms

The LG reform processes are jointly financed by the Government of Tanzania (GoT) and development partners who provide funding through a basket modality. The development partners financing the reform process through the basket arrangement included by the time the training was delivered Britain, Denmark, EU, Finland, Ireland, Netherlands, Norway, and UNDP/UNCDF⁵.

In addition to the financing of the reform processes, a lot of funds are either channeled to and/or used for the benefit of LGAs and communities including those through non-earmarked central government transfers, sector funds through the Sector Wide Approach (SWAps) as well as donor specific programmes to complement the LGA generated local revenues.

1.2 Background to the National Programme for Councillors Training

The LG reforms alluded to above provide for the creation of LGAs that operate with discretionary powers within the national context. Section 12 (1) of the Local Authority (Elections) Act, 1979, stipulates that there shall be held an ordinary election of councillors of a local government authority in every fifth year after the previous ordinary election⁶. The councils constitute the highest political authority within their areas of jurisdiction. Consequently, the councillors are mandated among other things to make bye-laws, pass their annual budget, approve development and sector plans, and adopt their own organizational and staffing arrangements. The councils are hence mandated to decide and implement all kinds of activities which are

---

Text Box 1:

Mandatory and permissive functions and duties of LGAs

Mandatory functions and duties include:
- maintenance of law, order and good government
- promotion of social and economic welfare and well being of all persons residing within the areas of their jurisdiction
- furtherance of economic and social development in their areas effective collection and proper utilization of revenues of local government authorities
- making bye-laws for the implementation of national and local policies the consideration, regulation and coordination of development plans, projects and programmes so as to ensure more beneficial development and mobilization of productive forces to combat poverty, disease and ignorance, and for the control and improvement of agriculture, trade, commerce and industry.

Permissive functions:
These are those which local authorities may perform depending on the availability of resources. These include control or prescription of methods of husbandry on agricultural land; the building, equipping and letting of shops and dwelling houses; the establishment, maintenance operations, and control of drainage and sewerage works; and any other functions which may be beneficial to the residents of their areas.

---

⁵ The Tanzania National Programme for Councillors Training was financed from this basket up to a tune of 4.726 Billion Tshs from its inception through design, delivery and monitoring. Given the 3,425 councillors trained, the unit cost per councillor is Tshs 1,390,409. At the exchange rate of Tshs 1000 (by the time of the training) to the USD the approximate unit cost per councillor is USD 1,394.

⁶ Please refer to the Local Authority (Elections) Act, 1979: with amendments up to 30th June, 2005.
not in conflict with existing laws and regulations and which serve general welfare and public purposes. These services include primary education, primary and preventive health, district hospitals, water supply, sewerage and sanitation, district and feeder roads and agricultural extension. The general duties and functions of LGAs are divided into two categories namely mandatory and permissive summarised in text box 1.

It was, however, reported that “the councillors in Tanzania LGAs are generally of a moderate education background”\(^7\). This among other things implies that most of the councillors had inadequate knowledge and skills to execute their stipulated mandates. In particular, many of the councillors elected in 2000 were serving for the first time and their tenure of office coincided with important stages in the restructuring and strategic planning process as well as the coming into effect of the new local government service regulations. In light of the eminent challenges and performance dysfunctions, a standardised and phased national programme for councillors training was designed and delivered under the LGRP\(^8\).

1.3 Background to the Training Impact Evaluation (TIE)

UN-HABITAT is the focal point for local authorities in the UN system and works among other priorities to promote capacity building responses to the growing challenges faced by local governments worldwide. The Training and Capacity Building Branch (TCBB) of UN-HABITAT has been supporting local government capacity building efforts and programmes for over fifteen years.

This TIE falls within TCBB’s framework of strengthening its focus on Training Impact on Performance (TIP). In October 2005, TCBB co-organized with the University of Manchester a workshop in Manchester on ‘Making Learning Matter: Training Impact on Performance’. It was hence resolved to establish an interest group to further brainstorm on operationalizing TIP. The Development Planning Unit (DPU), University College London, has been commissioned to undertake a broader assignment on TIP with UN-HABITAT and will share the process of undertaking the evaluation through a TIP-e-forum of national training institutes established by the above Manchester meeting.

In January 2006, the LGRP of PMO-RALG requested UN-HABITAT to assist in the undertaking of an evaluation of the National Programme for Councillors Training undertaken by the GoT through PMO-RALG in 2003/04. TCBB of UN-HABITAT responded favourably to this request, which fitted closely within their mandate and provided a practical contribution to evaluate TIP. UN-HABITAT consequently funded the international consultants to undertake the assignment, and provided staff time to oversee the assignment, in close collaboration with the LGRP. The LGRP, as the local counterpart provided in-kind contributions for the internal travel and logistics in Tanzania.

---


\(^8\) The design of the training programme including the identification of needs and developing training materials started in 2001 but the delivery was executed in 2003/04.
2.0 TIE APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

2.1 Preparation and Orientation

The team held initial briefings with UN-HABITAT in Nairobi where they discussed the scope, approach, work plan as well as reporting requirements and expected outputs/deliverables. In the process the LGRP in Dar es Salaam was also consulted through a phone briefing and further e-mail communication.

The team then reviewed secondary data that informed the design of the methodology, evaluation instruments and tools (see references in annex 1). The evaluation instruments and tools included checklists/interview guide that were used during the key informant interviews, focus group discussions and documentary review as well as a self administered questionnaire to be filled by the trained councillors (see annex 6).

The methodology, evaluation instruments and tools were discussed in Nairobi with UN-HABITAT and DPU. The instruments and tools were subsequently refined based on the comments from UN-HABITAT, DPU and the practical experiences gained from Ilala Municipal Council. For example the self administered questionnaire that was translated to Kiswahili was tested and refined in as far as question wording and order is concerned. The final evaluation instruments and tools which are however taken as a living document were submitted to UN-HABITAT for initial sharing with the e-forum.

2.2 Data Collection

The team discussed organizational arrangements with the LGRP including providing for the participation of the PMO-RALG counterpart as a learning process, discussing the work plan, making of appointments with the sampled councils and other agencies plus agreeing on team coordination arrangements in the field.

Consultations were then conducted at the national, regional, council and community levels. At the national level, consultations involved key informant interviews and focus group discussions with Association of Local Authorities of Tanzania (ALAT), South African Extension Unit (SAEU), LGRP, and development partners.

At the regional levels, key informant interviews were held with the members of the Zonal Reform Teams (ZRTs), regional trainers and staff who constituted the Regional Oversight Group (ROG).

At council level, the team sampled four rural councils (districts) and three urban councils (1 city and 2 municipalities) making a total of seven councils representing 4 zones and 5 regions based on the following pre-agreed criteria.

The districts sampled are Kibaha, Karatu, Magu, and Monduli and the municipalities are Ilala, Mtwara-Mikindani and Mwanza City. The sampling criteria for these councils as well as the wards are summarized in annex 3.
In each sampled council, the councillors who were trained filled a self administered questionnaire. Thereafter both the trained and newly elected councillors were engaged in a FGD. Attempts to have separate FGDs of male and female councillors was rejected as the councillors argued that they received the same training, attend the same council meetings and that the women had been particularly empowered to articulate not only women issues but issues that concern both women and men at all levels. Nevertheless, during the FGDs, the team ensured that the voices of the female councillors were heard. In addition, FGDs were held with the council management team including the council executive directors, heads of departments and other staff.

Two wards were sampled from each council with the exception of Ilala Municipal Council where four wards were sampled for methodology testing purposes. In each of the wards, discussions were held with the Ward Development Committee (WDC) members, Ward Executive Officer (WEO), members of NGOs and CBOs as well as female and male community members. In addition projects linked to the training of councillors were also visited to establish the extent to which the project can be attributed to the councillors’ training.

The team worked together in Ilala Municipal Council to test the methodology and learn from each other. At this juncture, the team was joined by UN-HABITAT staff. Thereafter, the team split into two sub-teams for wider coverage within the limited timeframe. However, the team had inbuilt mechanisms of sharing and comparing notes as work progressed. The TIE sub-teams were supported by the respective ZRTs.

### 2.3 Analysis and Reporting

The team drafted a tentative report format during the preparatory phase of the assignment. This allowed for the progressive generation of the report involving daily reviews, analysis, drawing of inferences and making tentative conclusions.

For the quantitative data, generated from the self administered questionnaire, the team designed a data capture screen, entered and analyzed data using Access. In both the qualitative and quantitative data analysis the team paid special attention to the peculiar concerns and issues raised by both female and male respondents and informants. The qualitative and quantitative data was then compared and contrasted with information captured from secondary sources.

---

1. The four zones from which the districts and municipalities were sampled are Arusha, Dar es Salaam, Mwara and Mwanza.
2. In total 70 self administered questionnaires were filled by the trained councillors. Out of these 54 representing 34% were women and 46 representing 66% were men.
3. For example in Ilala Municipal Council, the women councillors were very articulate and better prepared than their male counterparts. In one case, a female councillor challenged a male councillor who had wanted an overview of the training programme by bringing out the full set of the modules and thoroughly explaining the objectives and contents of each of them.
The team prepared a debriefing note/presentation that was discussed with the LGRP to ensure validity and comprehensiveness of the evaluation findings and recommendations at the end of the fieldwork. Thereafter the draft report was compiled, submitted and reviewed with UN-HABITAT in Nairobi. The team also received comments from the LGRP which were incorporated to produce the final TIE report.

### 2.4 Feedback and Reflection

One of the justifications for undertaking the TIE in Tanzania was for it to act as a practical test case for the TIP and e-forum initiative undertaken by UN-HABITAT in collaboration with DPU. The team therefore shared methodological notes with the DPU, reflected and extracted lessons from the councillors training programme in Tanzania that can be replicated and used for broader institutionalization of training programmes. These reflections and lessons learnt are presented both as part of this report but also as a separate working brief to inform the e-forum on training.

### 2.5 Process Challenges and Mitigation

In some of the councils (Karatu, Ilala, and Magu), the Council Link Persons (CLPs) were not met for different reasons. For example in Ilala the CLP was transferred and in Karatu he was on study leave. To get sufficient information, the team discussed with a wide range of council staff in the respective councils. Notwithstanding the above, where the CLPs were met, they provided useful insights. See text box 2

---

**Text box 2:**

**Typical Tasks for CLP: A case of Mwanza**

After getting his letter of appointment from CD of MCC, council link person (CLP) wrote back to CD asking him to call for an all inclusive meeting of all councillors plus heads of departments. The purpose of the meeting was to discuss among others: - venue, transport, and allowance (Tshs. 20,000 per day instead of the usual Tshs. 40,000 for normal council meetings in Mwanza). The immediate reaction from councillors was negative.

From the meeting it was resolved that they were not going to conduct the training in Mwanza City. The next challenge was transport. The official/training budget only allowed Tshs. 5,000 per participant. The major issue was therefore how to fill the gap. Finally it was agreed that a 25 seater mini-bus with a carriage on the roof be hired. This was to carry 20 councillors while the rest were to be ferried in the mayor’s vehicle.

The other issue that was to be tackled was accommodation. The budget allowed only Tshs.10, 000 per night. At the outset it was clear that hotel accommodation outside Mwanza was rather poor. The CLP was to ascertain the suitability of accommodation, safety and general upkeep for all the councillors. He paid visits to DCs and District police to alert them of the coming of councillors into their area and to seek adequate protection for them.

At the same time he identified the Guest of Honour to open the training event from the hosting town. This led to some unexpected expenditure that CLP had to meet and then claim latter from the council.

In the meantime, CLP – used to carry a lot of money. He therefore talked and submitted the money to the district treasurer, and only took the mandatory daily requirement.

**Source:** TIE field work
Similarly where the regional trainers could not be met, trainers from a neighbouring region were used as substitute informants. For example the regional trainers of Lindi region were met instead of those in Mtwara region who were not available.

The TIE coincided with the planning and budgeting process in councils. This meant that the staff had to balance the use of their time between meeting the TIE team and finalizing their plans and budgets. The team therefore had to organize shorter and more focused meetings at venues and times that were more suitable to the staff.

Councillors who are members of the Finance Committee in Monduli were attending an orientation on the Local Government Capital Development Grant (LGCDG) system in Moshi hence could not participate in the meeting. In Magu District, the Council Chairperson was attending a chairpersons’ meeting in Mwanza. Discussions were held with the councillors present who provided sufficient information.

The informants especially at the ward level had difficulties in distinguishing the difference between the training of the councillors and those undertaken by other members of the WDCs. The team laboured to continually explain that the scope of the TIE was limited to the national programme for councillors training that was conducted between 2003 and 2004.

The informants at the ward level were sometimes generally discussing the personalities and good performance of the respective councillors sometimes not directly related to the training activity being evaluated. The informants were explained by the team to focus on the noted changes in performance of the councillors from 2003 when the training being evaluated was delivered.

The participants in the meetings were also raising issues affecting them beyond the scope of the training for example the need to increase their allowances and provision of work environment facilities and tools. Whereas these issues were taken note of by the team, the informants were constantly reminded to refocus and relate their responses to the training. “The decentralization system in this country in general is not accompanied by the requisite empowerment and staff necessary for execution of responsibilities thereof particularly at front line level. What does the reform programme mean to me at my mtaa level?”  One of the participants at the community meeting posed? This and many similar sentiments were raised at various sessions that the TIE team held.
2.6 The team and acknowledgement

The TIE team consisted of members whose names are listed in table 1 below.

Table 1: Team Composition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Contact Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emmanuel Mugalaasi Ssewankambo</td>
<td>Mentor Consult Ltd, UgandaOffice</td>
<td>Tel: +256-41-345739, Mobile Tel: +256-772-411051, Tel Fax: +256-41-342149, E-mail: <a href="mailto:mentor@africaonline.co.ug">mentor@africaonline.co.ug</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elijah Agevi</td>
<td>Research Triangle Africa, Kenya</td>
<td>Office Tel: +254-2-249000, Mobile Tel: +254-721-203218, E-mail: <a href="mailto:Elijah.agevi@wananchi.com">Elijah.agevi@wananchi.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deborah Mkemwa</td>
<td>PMO –RALG Dodoma, Tanzania</td>
<td>Office Tel: +255-26- 222117249/50/51/52, Mobile Tel: +255-741 229386, E-mail: <a href="mailto:deby802000@yahoo.com">deby802000@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The team worked closely with and used as resource persons Asa Jonsson (UN-HABITAT), Brendan Glynn (LGRP) and Jack M. Nyakirang’ani (LGRP).

The TIE team extends its sincere gratitude to all those persons, some of whom are listed in appendix 4 that spared their time, shared their opinions and provided valuable information without which this TIE would not have been effectively executed. However, the specific analysis, conclusions and recommendations in this report are those of the team, and are not necessarily shared by GoT and UN-HABITAT.
3.0 PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS

Under this chapter we present and analyze the findings in regard to pre-training activities, the scope and training processes, impact on job behaviour/performance, impact on organization and human settlements.

3.1 Analysis of the Pre-Training Activities

This section covers the process through which the capacity gaps and needs were identified as well as giving an outline of the specific gaps that were identified.

3.1.1 Capacity needs assessment process

Through an open bidding process, the LGRP commissioned the South African Extension Unit (SAEU) to formulate an approach to the training of councillors and its operationalisation including defining the learning objectives, subject matter (content), approach of delivery (delivery strategy) as well as a mix of delivery methods.

The methods used by SAEU in executing the assignment included review of secondary data, key informant interviews with the male and female councillors, council staff, ALAT, PMO-RALG, members of the training institutions as well as administering structured questionnaires to the councillors. The findings of the assignment were presented to a stakeholders’ meeting in order to validate and complement the identified needs and the recommended approach.

Whereas there was a deliberate effort to find out the tailored needs of councillors in district, city, municipal and town councils, differences between newly elected and old councillors as well as differences between male and female councillors, the emerging needs were not significantly different to warrant the design of different course materials. It was further noted that combining continuing and new councillors, as well as male and female councillors would on one hand be a refresher opportunity to the previously trained councillors13 and on the other promote team building, and enhance cross-learning and sharing of experiences.

At this stage, it was recommended that: the course should focus on the full range of councillor’s roles and responsibilities; the materials should be in a form of self instructional materials; the course should be modular, combining distance and residential training to impart both knowledge (conceptual) and skills (practical) aspects14.

The capacity needs assessment process allowed for the identification of actual training needs and gaps plus appropriate approaches of training the councillors, building on the lessons gained from the previous practical operations and training interventions.

Notwithstanding the wide consultations made, the needs assessment stage would have been enriched by inputs from the community.

---

13 It was reported that between 1995 and 2000, there were various training programmes for the councillors. However, they neither systematically covered the whole country nor the whole mandate of the councillors.

14 SAEU reported that they built on the experience gained during the delivery of a similar course to councillors whilst at a small scale during the period 1997/1998.
members on their perception of the performance gaps of their councillors, a process that was not possible because of the alleged time constraints.

### 3.1.2 Capacity Needs Identified

During the above process of formulating an approach to the training of councillors and its operationalisation, there were a number of arguments made to justify the training of councillors. These include: a general outcry about the poor performance of councillors as manifested by among other things the poor service delivery and a need for good governance in the local councils; and the need for the councillors to understand and thereafter participate in the implementation of government policies and programmes. Text box 3, below summarizes the performance discrepancies, councillors expectations as well as the expected results.

#### Text Box 3

**Councillors Expectations and Performance Discrepancies**

1. Understanding of laws governing LGA operations;
2. Understanding the procedures of making LGA by laws;
3. Ability of conducting meetings in line with the laws, regulation and procedures;
4. Understanding the roles and responsibilities of councillors and their work boundaries;
5. Understanding & improving relationships between councillors & executives in LGA operations
6. Understanding and adhering to councillors’ ethics and code of conduct;
7. Knowledge & skills for administration of LGAs under multiparty democracy;
8. Skills for provision and control of social and economic services to the community;
9. Skills for sensitising the community & other stakeholders in development projects;
10. Skills for planning, implementing, controlling and monitoring development plans;
11. Skills for decision making in providing services to the community;
12. Skills for identifying sources of revenue, mobilising & controlling revenue collection;
13. Ability to manage & control LGA revenue and expenditure;
14. Understanding of the procedures of preparing council budgets;
15. Understanding laws and regulations of finance management;
16. Confidence in administering and controlling development plans and projects;
17. Understanding the Local Government Reform Programme’s roles; and
18. Creation of a strong and harmonious team of Local Government Councillors.

During the discussions with the councillors, there was an overwhelming concurrence that the expectations they had before the training were largely met. Similarly, the quantitative analysis revealed that, 76% of the councillors who had attended the training either strongly agreed or agreed that their expectations were met and only 4% strongly disagreed.

#### Table 2: Training matched participants’ expectations by gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Training matched expectations</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frequency (%)</td>
<td>Frequency (%)</td>
<td>Frequency (%)</td>
<td>Frequency %</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>5 (21)</td>
<td>8 (17)</td>
<td>13 (19)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>16 (67)</td>
<td>24 (52)</td>
<td>40 (57)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>2 (8)</td>
<td>8 (17)</td>
<td>10 (14)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>- (0)</td>
<td>4 (9)</td>
<td>4 (6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>1 (4)</td>
<td>2 (4)</td>
<td>3 (4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>24 (100)</td>
<td>46 (100)</td>
<td>70 (100.0)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Our findings reinforce the findings of the monitoring and quality control report, which indicated that by the end of the training, 77% of the trained councillors reported that the expectations they had expressed at the beginning of the training were highly met, 25% as met on average and 1% as lowly met.

### 3.2 Analysis of the Scope and Training Processes

Under this section we highlight and analyze content, process and organizational support aspects of the training.

#### 3.2.1 Content issues

a) Analysis of the topics

The course topics and content were designed to address the capacity gaps identified by the councillors and LG practitioners as well to address the concerns of national policies. The consultant (SAEU) recommended that the councillors should be trained in subjects which cover the full range of roles and responsibilities that are both statutory and non statutory in nature as well as those of the council in general. Text box 4 below provides an outline of the modules and topics covered. (see following page)

---

**Text box 4**

**Outline of the Modules and Topics Covered**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Module 1: Legal and evolutionary background of LG system in Tanzania</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) History and legitimacy of LGs in the country;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Reforms and management of LG affairs;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Laws governing structure, mandates, duties and responsibilities of LGs;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Laws governing LG affairs;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) Legal systems and gender representation in LG Councils;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f) Legal relationship between Central and Local Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g) Laws regarding disciplinary action in LGAs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Module 2: Roles and responsibilities of the councilor in leadership and management of LGs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Management of LGs under multi-party democracy;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Political and administrative structure and practical relations in LGAs;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Legal roles and responsibilities of a councillor;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Councillors opportunity in maintaining good governance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Module 3: Role of councillors in delivery of services and mobilisation of development in LGs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) A councillor as a mobilizer and supervisor of social and economic service delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) A councillor as a mobilizer and supervisor of planning and implementation of development plans in the council;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) A councillor as a monitor and mobilizer against public disasters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Module 4: Management and control of LG finances</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Supervising and monitoring of LG revenues;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Supervising and monitoring of LG expenditures;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Preparation of LG budgets in LGs considering gender (mainstreaming gender in budgeting);</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

In addition to the four modules there were Guides (from book 5 to 7): Book 5: Skills Guide detailing the skills (practical) aspects of module 1-4; Book 6: Councillors Course Guide focusing on learning to use modules via distance learning; Book 7: Trainers Guide for organizing the knowledge and skills aspects.
An overwhelming majority of councillors (73%) highly appreciated the course content in the modules both the knowledge and skills aspects. They in particular appreciated the important roles they are required to play in the running and management of council affairs as well as mobilisation of communities to participate in the planning, implementation and management of development initiatives at the grassroots level.

Table 3: Topics relevant and sufficient to meets needs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topics relevant needs</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Specified</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above notwithstanding, they reported that some modules were either difficult, lacked in detail and/or were overtaken by policy and legislative changes. For example chapter 2 of module 1 that explains the LG reforms was reported difficult to comprehend by especially the councils where the LG reform programmes were not yet implemented by the time the training was delivered. Now that the LG reform programme has covered all the councils in the country, this module is likely to be better understood in the next round of training. In addition, whereas module 4 enabled the councillors to appreciate their role in managing the resources of the council, it was reported to be lacking details and also providing inaccurate information in some cases. For instance it requires the councillors to scrutinize vouchers yet this is ideally supposed to be an internal audit function. Because of the above inaccuracies, there are cases where the executives (staff) were reported to be challenging the councillors arguing that the content of the materials is moreover not lawful.

There is therefore need to check and thoroughly edit the training materials to ensure that they are consistent with the laws and practices before re-printing. The councils should also be encouraged to diversify sources and mainstream the provision of supplementary skills training on the roles and responsibilities of the councillors. For example they could use some of the Capacity Building Grant (CBG) provided under the LGCDG system.

b) Analysis of the training materials

Through yet another open bidding process, the LGRP commissioned SAEU to develop the training materials. SAEU mobilized a multi-disciplinary team with practical LG experience to develop the training materials in specific thematic areas. In addition, staff with practical experience in the development of self instruction materials were included on the team.
A writers’ workshop was organized to discuss and agree on the content of each of the modules as recommended by the stakeholders at the previous needs assessment stage and to train the writers on how to write self-instructional materials for adult distance learning. In addition, the writers developed, discussed and agreed on the framework for producing the materials as a mechanism for standardizing the materials irrespective of the writer and thematic area. Further SAEU had inbuilt monitoring and quality control arrangements where materials were checked for comprehensiveness, consistency, and relevance to learning at a distance.

The draft materials were then presented to, reviewed and complemented by a selected team of experienced council chairpersons/mayors, council directors, PMO-RALG and ALAT in a workshop organized by the LGRP. The developers of the training materials incorporated the comments from the workshop and refined the materials. The training materials were finally tested in Iringa District Council for relevance of the content, appropriateness of the approach and methods as well as sufficiency of the allocated time/duration by a group of six core trainers. The comments from the pilot testing were also incorporated in the materials before the materials were finally approved for use and were signed-off by PMO-RALG.

The course materials were then printed and a set distributed to each of the councillors during the respective phases of course delivery. In addition copies of the training materials were reported given to all the DEDs, CLPs, and members of the ROG. The course materials distributed to the councillors consisted of four knowledge (resource) modules, one skills training module and one councillors course guide. Copies of the materials were adequate and councillors retained the training materials for their future reference and use. In addition to the above materials, the regional trainers were issued with the trainers guide.

The training materials were reported relevant, well prepared, user friendly in terms of simplicity of language, adequacy, logical sequence of topics, realistic and highly appreciated case studies. In Mtwara-Mikindani for instance, the councillors reported to have even improvised additional and tailored case studies. This fact is further corroborated by the quantitative findings where 80% of the councillors appreciated the quality and appropriateness of the training materials.

### Table 4: Training materials well designed and appropriate

| Training materials well designed | Female | | | Male | | | Total | |
|-------------------------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
|                               | Frequency | % | Frequency | % | Frequency | % | Frequency | % |
| Strongly Agree                | 7 | 29 | 10 | 22 | 17 | 24 |
| Agree                         | 14 | 58 | 25 | 54 | 39 | 56 |
| Not Sure                      | 2 | 8 | 7 | 15 | 9 | 13 |
| Disagree                      | 1 | 4 | - | 0 | 4 | 6 |
| Not Specified                 | - | 0 | 4 | 9 | 1 | 1 |
| Total                         | 24 | 100 | 46 | 100 | 70 | 100 |
Despite the above positive findings, the process of developing the training materials took rather a longer time than expected leading to the eventual delays in the delivery of the training. Some participants also asserted that the quality of the printing was rather poor leading to the loss of some pages. In addition, copies of the laws, policies and the constitution referred to during the training were not availed to the councillors for reference. Moreover, the training materials were distributed to individual councillors, some of them losing and/or not using the materials. There were further no copies provided for common use and reference even for council staff. The materials claimed to have been given to the DED, CLP and ROG were either reportedly not received or they were not widely shared.

In future, copies of the training materials should be distributed to the districts, municipalities, town councils and wards for easy access and use by even the stakeholders that did not attend the training. Both the training materials and policies should be stored in friendly and easily accessible places for example the resource centers/registries at the various LGAs or ward offices. In addition, there is a need to prepare an addendum to the training materials to cater for the recent policy and administrative changes as well as improvements that may have emerged since the delivery of the previous training. This would require a comprehensive review/checking of the materials to identify the areas that need improvements, changes and/or clarification of implications to the councillors’ operations. There is moreover a need to ensure consistency in content with the standardised materials developed under the LGCDG system.

### 3.2.2 Process/Mechanics issues

#### a) Analysis of the Trainers

Two regional trainers were selected from each region making a total of 40\(^{20}\). These were complemented with six reserve trainers to fill any trainers’ gaps that may emerge during the process of training delivery. Out of the initial 40 trainers, 10 were female and 30 were male trainers. Twenty five (25) of the trainers were government officers still in services while 15 were retirees.

The regional trainers were nominated by their respective regions (RAS) who submitted names of 2 to 4 potential trainers with their profiles to the LGRP. The requirements for nomination included skills in adult learning techniques as well as knowledge in LG policies and operations. The LGRP vetted the names before they were selected from the nominated pool of trainers and finally approved. The regional trainers were then contracted by the LGRP. The regional trainers were oriented in a ToT for one week facilitated by the course writers, officials from the LGRP and PMO-RALG at Iringa.

---

\(^{20}\) It should be noted that by the time the regional trainers were selected, Manyara, the 21\(^{st}\) region in Tanzania was not yet created.
Table 5: Quality of the trainers was good

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality of regional trainers was good</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>37.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>51.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Specified</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From table 5 above, 88% of the respondents agreed that the quality of the trainers was good. During the FGDs, the councillors reported good cooperation between them and the trainers. For example the trainers were said to have given good interventions to the councillors' inputs during both the plenary and group discussions. Most of the trainers had hands-on experience with LG operations and displayed adequate insight of the course contents. The trainers further made good use of the training guide provided as part of the training materials.

Similarly, the training specialists who were monitoring the quality of the training appreciated the level of competence of the regional trainers in administering the training in accordance with the standard procedures given in the trainer’s guide. In addition to facilitating the trainings, the regional trainers were involved in management aspects of the training including arranging ROG meetings, liaising with the CLPs and compiling progress reports.

However, there were cases where regional trainers conducted the training sessions individually. This was exhaustive on behalf of the trainers but also monotonous on behalf of the trainees. In some regions (like Arusha) none of the two regional trainers was specialized in financial management. The implication was that the financial management module was not adequately delivered and no wonder this was the module that enlisted high dissatisfaction levels.

Given the high appreciation rate of the trainers, we are proposing that the regional trainers, as practically as possible, continue to be utilized. However, there is expressed need to balance the skills of the trainers and ensure that one of the trainers in a team is specialized in financial management. Arrangements should also be made for the regional trainers to facilitate across neighbouring regions. This would expose them to new challenges and lessons and also allow the councillors to interface with a wide range of trainers. The trainers from Kigoma who delivered the training in Mwanza City were reported to have been very effective. There is also need to inbuild mechanisms for the trainers to meet and share practical experiences gained during the delivery of the training. This would serve as a refresher for the trainers.
There is also need to explore possibilities of using councillors that have excelled in performance. This could be an incentive for encouraging and sustaining good performance and use of knowledge and skills of councillors and also would allow for wider coverage of the councils in a shorter timeframe. It should however be noted that such councillors would require thorough orientation in adult training skills and the selection process should be transparent and merit based to avoid de-motivating those councillors not selected. For example, the councillors could identify the criteria for good performance and select the better performing councillors. Alternatively, the councillors could be used to share practical experiences on how they perform rather than being trainers.

b) Analysis of the methods
During the residential trainings, the regional trainers combined the knowledge (conceptual) as well as skills (practical) sessions. For the knowledge sessions, the trainers used a mix of plenary presentations and group discussions. For the skills oriented sessions the trainers adopted a wide range of methods including case studies, role plays, simulation exercises, demonstrations and brainstorming.

The trainers considered the plenary and group work sessions under the knowledge aspect as having been highly successful. For the skills aspects, the case studies were the most valued and appreciated method. Like the trainers, the majority of the councillors (76%) considered these methods to be highly effective ways for enhancing the mastery of the course contents as there was reported peer teaching and peer support.

Nonetheless, the women (in Monduli) claimed to have been more active than the men in preparing presentations from the group discussions to the plenary. This on the one hand could imply that the female councillors were overworked but on the other hand it clearly shows that the female councillors had gained confidence to prepare and present in plenary sessions. Such confidence and skills could eventually be handy during the council and ward meetings as well as during the mobilisation of communities for development.

Hence, the methods used in the first round of training should continue but with an attempt to ensure both active and equitable participation of both female and male participants.

c) Analysis of the training strategy
Two training strategies were used: residential seminars/workshops for the knowledge and skills aspects of all modules and distance training/learning approach for individual in-depth study of modules 2 to 4. In determining the training strategy/approach, a number of factors were considered. These included the experience from previous training; nature of training materials; availability of resources (human and financial); characteristics of the target group; size of the target group and time available for the implementation of the training.
The residential training made councillors to get involved in intensive learning processes, enabled face to face interaction with the trainers and fellow councillors, enhanced consistent interaction with the training materials, encouraged peer teaching, experiences sharing and controlled skills training. The skills aspect of the training in particular helped councillors to learn from each other and for the trainers to provide on the spot testing of understanding as well as backstopping support. Table 6 below demonstrates that 74% of the respondents either strongly agreed or agreed that the training strategy was appropriate.

Table 6: Training strategies were appropriate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Training strategy was appropriate</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Specified</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td>70</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the quality control and monitoring report by SAEU, the percentage of councillors who attended the residential training sessions for the entire duration slightly dropped from 97% under Module 1 to 92% under Module 4. These levels of retention in a training programme that targeted adult beneficiaries is commendable. In addition, it was reported that phasing of the training facilitated the councillors to internalize the training content especially because the time span between the residential sessions was long enough.

However, many of the councillors reported that their abilities to prepare and follow their independent study schedules during the time provided for distance learning were low because of the demands of their multiple social, political and economic activities. This implies that the councillors made limited use of the period set for independent study. Nevertheless, it was reported that the trainers tasked the councillors to spend more time during the review stage of the residential training to go through and discuss in detail the contents of the course modules thereby overcrowding the time allocated for the residential sessions.

For distance learning to be more effective, there is need to elicit higher interest and commitment by the trainee through for example: giving specific assignments to the councillors as they go for the distance learning phase; request the CLPs and RTs to periodically follow-up the councillors; and for the RTs to ask questions before the commencement of the following residential training.

There is also need to use a mix of strategies for example study tours and exchange visits to complement the residential and distance learning strategies. These supplementary strategies have been
particularly applicable to the Tanzanian context. ALAT with support from Freidrich Ebert Stifung (FES) reported to have taken councillors from Kigoma - Ujiji Town Council and Bariadi District Council for an exposure visit to Botswana to learn how councils participate under multi-party dispensation. The results from this exercise were reported positive and effective. To ensure sustainability of both the process and outcomes of these strategies, there is need to mainstream them into the council budgets as a means of institutionalization for example using the CBG under the LGCDG system.

d) Analysis of the target group

The training targeted councillors in all districts of Tanzania mainland totaling to 3,425 including 2,461 men and women respectively. By the end of delivering the training 36 councillors had dropped out. Fourteen (14) of the 36 were reported dead, 19 resigned and 3 were disqualified. Consequently 24 councillors from 11 regions had joined the training at module 4 stage to replace those that had dropped out. The majority (84%) of councillors confirmed that the target group was appropriate as illustrated in table 7: below.

Table 7: Target group was appropriate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target group was appropriate</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Specified</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The informants argued that the councillors are strategically positioned to undertake valid community responsive tasks and are closer to the people across the country. The impact from the training is therefore likely to be both deeply and widely felt. Moreover, jointly targeting the female and male councillors was reported appropriate in encouraging active and sustained participation.

Contrary to the above scenario, the councillors did not like the total exclusion of council staff from the training programme. Some of them claimed that their levels of knowledge and awareness are now far more than those of the council staff causing new kinds of rifts. There were also wide variations in the education qualification and pace of comprehension of councillors within and across districts necessitating further customization of materials during the delivery process.

The newly elected councillors and those that joined module 4 should be trained in the same topics that were covered in the previous training with the addendum proposed. Because of the relatively less numbers of newly elected councillors in each council compared to the previous training that targeted all councillors, the councillors may need to be clustered at regional levels depending on the numbers...
involved. This will also be a means of exposure and will provide an opportunity for experience sharing across councils.

For some of the modules especially where amendments have been made due for example to policy changes, the training should combine the continuing and newly elected councillors towards the end of the training. This will serve as a refresher to the continuing councillors but also facilitate peer learning. It will hence be a recap of the whole range of the training content.

The Councillors, the majority of whom are chairpersons of the WDCs, should be encouraged to attend the village and mtaa training organized by PMO-RALG to ensure harmonious and mutually reinforcing relationships within WDC.

Encourage creative information sharing at all levels of LG system. This should cover information sharing within and among the councils, as well as within and among PMO-RALG and the councils. A female participant in Upanga ward observed that “at the lower tiers of local government, there is very poor communication and extremely limited information sharing right from the council, the ward to the mtaa level. Many things are done without informing mtaa officials. How then can these initiatives be supported by the people?”

It is thus critical that there should be effective down ward information sharing to the lower local authorities and communities. This would involve exploring and mounting an aggressive sensitization/awareness creation campaign using multi-media approach (radio, TV, newspapers etc.) on the content, implication and expected results of the councillors training. This will among other things empower the constituents to demand for improved performance of the councillors.

Encourage councils to combine councillors with the staff to discuss selected aspects of the modules in order to get practical interpretation of their relationships. Such sessions should be organized by and in the respective councils (in-house).

e) Analyzing the levels of attendance

According to the monitoring and quality control report by SAEU, the average levels of attendance were 98% in module 1, 97% in module 2, 97% in module 3 and 96% in module 4. This represents a mere drop of 2% from module 1 to module 4. There were no significant differences in the attendance levels between male and female councillors. This was confirmed by the councillors in the FGDs who argued that there was not only high levels of attendance but very high levels of participation especially during the residential sessions. The quantitative results presented in table 8 below further attest to this.
It was argued that “such consistently high levels of attendance in a phased training that extended over duration of one year is remarkable and outstanding”. The informants attributed these levels of attendance and participation to a multitude of factors among others: motivation and/or willingness of the councillors to learn; relevance of the content; authority of the organizers of the training (PMO-RALG/LGRP); appropriateness of the delivery methods; as well as good logistics and material incentives including allowances provided by the LGRP.

However, there were significant regional variations in the councilor’s levels of attendance for modules 3 and 4. For example attendance for module 3 in Arusha region dropped to 88% because the councillors of one of the opposition CHADEMA party in Karatu District did not attend. Likewise the attendance for module 4 in Kilimanjaro region dropped to 90% due to resignation of councillors in Moshi District.

f) Analysis of the backstopping, quality control and oversight functions

Backstopping, quality control and oversight functions were conducted by a number of stakeholders including the DED and CLP, the regional trainers, ROG, training specialists (SAEU) and the LGRP.

The DED and CLP were responsible for the administrative and logistical oversight function including ensuring adherence to the time table, organisation of the venue, ensuring attendance of the participants, payment of allowances and accounting for the funds. However, it was reported that the CLPs were not provided with detailed schedule of duties thus provided varied and sometimes inadequate support and follow-up to the training process.

The ROG chaired by the Regional Administrative Secretary (RAS) and composed of regional LG officers and regional trainers was responsible for ensuring that the logistical arrangements are in place.
and that the training sessions are delivered as planned. In case of non-adherence to the stipulated arrangements, the ROG was expected to communicate to the concerned districts to take corrective actions. For example in Arumeru, Arusha zone, the ROG intervened to resolve a case where the councillors had refused to share a room in a residential training. On the whole, the ROG did not effectively function.

A consultant (SAEU) was commissioned to offer backstopping, monitoring and quality control services. This involved collection of information from all stakeholders including the CLP, ROG, regional trainers, councillors, and other stakeholders. The collection of information was done through field observations and use of structured instruments. SEAU used the same process to check adherence to the provided guidelines by the trainers and to offer backstopping support in all the stages of the training process in a sample of regions and LGAs\(^\text{23}\). SAEU produced reports that served to validate the information provided by the regional trainers and councillors.

In addition, the LGRP conducted monitoring visits, identified progress as well as constraints and recommended appropriate action to the consultants (SAEU) and regional trainers. SAEU put in place mechanisms for implementing corrective action through feedback, maintaining close contact and consultations between the parties involved and thereby promotes programme quality.

Table 9: Monitoring and quality assurance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The training was well monitored and quality assured</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Specified</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Whereas, the informants applauded the monitoring and quality control processes, the TIE team noted the absence and therefore a need to institute a systematic process of continually documenting the impact of training in the councils to complement the formal TIE activities. For example the data collection could be quarterly, bi-annually or annually.

\(^{23}\) All the 21 regions were inspected by the Training Specialists during the first and second leg and 27% and 24% of the LGAs were checked in the first and second leg respectively. Overall 58 LGA (51%) were inspected by the end of the programme.
3.2.3 Organisational and logistical support

a) Analysis of the training duration

The residential trainings were for a total of 21 days phased into: 7 days for module 1; 5 days for module 2 and 3; and 4 days for module 4. For each residential training time was earmarked for the knowledge and skills aspects as well as to prepare for the subsequent module. The majority (70%) were of the opinion that the daily training sessions were too long and tight.

Table 10: Duration of the training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The duration of the training was adequate</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Specified</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notwithstanding the above, the trainers associated the tight schedules during the residential session to the ineffective use of the time allocated for distance learning, the view shared by the TIE team. It is thus recommended that the duration of the training be maintained for the next rounds of training but as recommended above ensure that the distance learning process is made more effective.

b) Analysis of the timing and training schedules

The training was implemented from 2003 to early 2004. Yet the tenure of the councillors was supposed to expire in 2005. In addition and contrary to the initial plans, the delivery of the second half of the training faced considerable delays resuming in August 2003 instead of June/July 2003 for modules 2 and 3. Similarly, the delivery progression from module 3 to the end of module 4 also experienced delays being re-scheduled for implementation from October – December 2003 to December 2003 - February 2004.

In all councils, they reported that by that time of the training, the councillors were basically more focused on how to win the imminent elections than applying some of the knowledge and skills acquired. All informants in the FGDs concurred that the timing was inappropriate and may have undermined the potential impact of the training including not providing value for money.

At the same time, because of the unexpected delays, the training specialists of SAEU, who were supposed to inspect and backstop the training, experienced difficulties in keeping track of the training schedules in LGAs. The councillors and trainers were unanimous that these ad hoc postponements de-motivated them. In particular

---

24 It should be noted that the process of preparing for the training including the identification of needs and development of training materials started as far back as 2001.
the councillors were reported to have lost track of what they had learnt in the previous sessions.

The training programme for the newly elected councillors should therefore be launched early enough during their tenure in this case not later than end of 2006. Similarly all the subsequent trainings should be planned, and scheduled in advance so that it is conducted immediately after elections.

c) Analysing the venue for the training
The LGRP met the costs for the services and facilities in the venue including accommodation. The council directors with help from the CLPs were mandated to select and arrange the venue for the training based on the guidelines and budget ceilings provided by the LGRP.

Whereas the nature of the venues selected differed from council to council, it was reported that the selected venues were conducive for adult learning in terms of ample break away rooms and privacy and provided reasonable services.

The councillors however, expressed reservations about conducting residential trainings within their respective locations. “How could I explain to my family that I have gone for a residential training in Land Mark Hotel, which is a stones throw away from my home” lamented one of the councillors in Ilala Municipal Council during the TIE FGD.

The councillors hence expressed interest in being consulted in selecting the preferred venue for the training so long as it fits within the provided price ceilings.

d) Discussing logistical and administrative issues
In addition to meeting accommodation, breakfast, break tea, lunch and evening refreshment costs, the councillors were paid a daily allowance of Tsh 20,000/= from which they bought dinner. The funds were transferred to the regional secretariat. The regional secretariat retained the proportion used to meet expenses incurred at that level. The balance to meet training expenses at the council level was transferred to the respective councils. Hence, the funds to directly meet the councillors training expenses were administered at the council level.

The councillors liked being paid allowances during the residential training and this partly explains the high levels of attendance. However, the councillors did not like the full board arrangement and demanded to be paid the accommodation and meals in cash. Yet experience in other cases has demonstrated that the arrangement proposed by the councillors has a lot of organizational challenges (like timely attendance, overnight discussions etc..) that may compromise the quality of the training and hence attainment of the objectives.
3.3 Analysis of Impact on Individual Learning

3.3.1 Analysis of objectives
Whereas, the specific learning objectives of each of the sessions are specified in the respective modules, the overall objectives and goals of the training programme were not explicitly stated. Nevertheless as argued in the previous sections of this report, the training content in the modules was sufficient to meet the councillors’ expectations and this is one of the factors that has contributed to the reported very high levels of councillors’ attendance and willingness to learn. Similarly, as outlined in section 3.4 below, there were a number of positive outcomes and impacts that can be associated with the training.

For future training programmes, there is need to formulate and widely publicize the overall objectives of the training in order for the councillors and other stakeholders to have a shared vision of the expected training outcome. Further more, to enhance monitoring of the attainment of objectives, there is need to clearly state the hierarchy of these objectives showing a logical vertical linkage between the inputs/activities, outputs/learning, outcomes/job behaviors and impact/organizational effectiveness. In addition, indicators for measuring the attainment of the respective objectives as well as means of verification and assumptions should also be stated to provide the basis for eventual focused monitoring and evaluation of progress.

3.3.2 Analysis of the acquisition of knowledge and skills
Under this section we describe the perception of the different stakeholders on the extent to which the councillors had acquired the knowledge and skills as expected at the beginning of the training.25

The majority of councillors ranked the mastery of the knowledge as high (63% module 1, 53% module 2, 68% module 3, and 72% module 4). Like under the acquisition of knowledge, the majority of councillors ranked the mastery of the skills even higher, 74% module 1, 71% module 2, 77% module 3, and 68% module 4). These rankings were confirmed during the FGDs with the stakeholders during this TIE.

In addition, the trainers were generally pleased with the performance of councillors. For example, during the monitoring and quality control exercise conducted in 2004, the trainers were confident that 93 – 96% of the councillors had mastered the course contents and 97-99% had appreciated their training.

As a result, there is increased confidence of councillors across the board and particularly among female councillors. One female councillor in Mtwara-Mikindani Municipal Council directly attributes her direct election to the training as opposed to the previous special councillor status.

---

25 Please note that the attitudinal changes are discussed under the improvements in job behaviour/performance below.

26 Please refer to Table F/XIII: Councilors assessment (%) of their mastery of knowledge and skills under modules 1-4: in the Final report for the consultancy to provide monitoring and quality control services for the national programme for councillors training.
3.4 Impact on Job Behaviour, Organisation and Human Settlements

Under this sub-section we make a comparison of councillors’ performance before and after the training and highlight the changes in performance that are associated with the training underscoring where applicable the differences between female and male councillors. As a control measure, in some cases we make a comparison of performance between the trained and recently elected and untrained councillors. Further, for each of the issues outlined, we discuss changes in job behaviour, how it manifests and impacts on organisation effectiveness and how it translates into improvements in human settlements.

3.4.1 Adherence to legal provisions and procedures

a) Adherence to council meeting procedures

The councillors and council staff asserted that the councillors are now following council procedures for conducting meetings and debates. They in addition make logical and constructive inputs and follow-ups.

It was noted by the team that the councillors make sufficient consultations with the council staff prior to the council meetings. In some councils, the councillors have an agreed schedule of meetings and receive agenda items and supporting documents in advance to allow for ample preparations including consultations with the constituents on key issues. The female and male councillors alike were reported to be asking pertinent questions and as per agenda item, which was not the case before. The habit of deliberately extending the duration of council meetings to justify getting additional allowances was reported to have significantly reduced. In the case of Mtwara-Mikindani MC, it was stated that councillors are now listening and respecting the opinion and advice from the technical staff and in return, the council staff are thoroughly preparing their inputs to council. There is also improved conduct of WDC meetings. For example in Kibaha District, it was reported that the habit where the councillors were dominating the WDC meeting had vanished. As a result council meetings are taking shorter time than the case was previously. This was reported at both the council level as well as the ward level where the trained councillors chair the WDC meetings. In all the sampled councils, it was claimed that the meetings that used to last for a week now are accomplished within a few hours.

The above notwithstanding, some of the newly elected councillors were reported to still ask questions even after the agenda item has been concluded justifying an urgent need for their training. Nevertheless, the trained councillors try to urge them to adhere to the council procedures.

---

27 For instance the team had a privilege of being in Magu District Council on the eve of the full council meeting and witnessed the dynamics in preparation for full council.
“The training has gradually led to increased team spirit among councillors, mitaa chairpersons, and us. This has resulted in enhanced and closer follow-up and ownership of the initiatives particularly by us citizens at the grassroots. We are very happy about this trend and we hope it continues in future”.

b) Collective responsibility and team work
The councillors reported to have developed team work spirit as well as collective sense of responsibility across party and gender divides. In Mtwara-Mikindani MC, the councillors are working jointly to implement projects in different wards particularly in school construction programmes.

“The training has gradually led to increased team spirit among councillors, mitaa chairpersons, and us. This has resulted in enhanced and closer follow-up and ownership of the initiatives particularly by us citizens at the grassroots. We are very happy about this trend and we hope it continues in future”.

In Monduli District Council, the councillors and council staff alike asserted that the councillors no longer contradict themselves in the council meetings on the issues previously discussed and resolved in their respective standing committees. In Mwanza City Council, the Mayor was reported to have organised a specific meeting for the councillors to deliberate and agree on the virtue of cooperation and team work between the new and continuing councillors. Councillors in Mtwara-Mikindani MC reprimanded a fellow councillor when they collectively concluded that he had gone overboard in a conflict with a council staff member. Such a self corrective measure among councillors was previously unheard of. The Mtwara-Mikindani councillors further resolved to systematically privatise some of the services starting with collection of revenue and cleansing of the main market. In doing this some of the political implications of this action such as laying off staff, who are often related to them, were fully understood.

c) Improved councillors work organisation
Before the training, the councillors used to frequently come to the council offices and to meet any council staff even without any specific purpose. In some cases, they were reported to be coming along with some community members to seek favours. After the training, the councillors have been reported to only come to the council offices on invitation or when they have a specific issue to address. They also currently address the issues through the relevant offices rather than previously when they could on an ad hoc basis approach any staff, at anytime and sometimes using uncivil language.

In Upanga East, the habit of the councillor sitting in the WEO’s office on a daily basis to watch what is transpiring has stopped and instead a conducive and supportive environment has emerged. In Mwanza City and Mtwara-Mikindani MC, the mayors have displayed on the doors to their offices the days and times for public consultations.

Consequently, staff are left with ample time to concentrate on their work and adhere to their work schedules without interruptions and harassment. Rifts between staff and councillors have reduced significantly and an improved and cordial working environment and relationships in the councils have emerged. The councillors especially the female ones can freely and confidently express and articulate their issues at committee and full council meetings. Most of the
female councillors interviewed confidently stated that they are at ease in conducting meetings at all levels.

However, there are cases where some councillors are backsliding. For example in Karatu District the council chairman was reported to be now coming to the District Council offices on a daily basis as opposed to the agreed and previously adhered to two days in a week. To counter check this trend, it is desirable as recommended in this report to mount a refresher course for all previously trained councillors which would also serve as a recap for the new councillors.

d) Adherence to guidelines and code of conduct
The councillors’ personality and adherence to the leadership ethics and code of conduct was reported to have changed positively. The cases where the councillors violate guidelines have reduced. In the same vain, the councillors dressing code has improved after they resolved that they needed to look like “Waheshimiwa” (honourable members). This in turn seems to have led to senior council staff dressing smartly at least for full council meetings as was witnessed by the team in Magu District.

There are also reduced cases of votes of no confidence for councillors as well as cases of expelling councillors due to contravention of the laws as the case was before the training. For example the councillors were reported to be emphasising the declaration of the assets as required under the leadership code.

The public image of the councillors has significantly improved. For example the FGDs at ward level, revealed that they now see their councillors as their true representational leaders. The staff in Ilala MC reported that the councillors are now befitting the honorable status.

3.4.2 Roles and responsibilities in relation to leadership and management

a) Cordial working relationship between the councillors and technical staff
The instances of conflict and animosity between the councillors and council staff experienced before the training have reduced significantly. In all councils visited it was claimed that the councillors no longer ask questions to the staff in a confrontational manner. In Magu and Mtwara-Mikindani councils, the female councillors in particular stated that the use of abusive language against fellow councillors and staff has been minimised.

“I have witnessed a 360 degrees turn-around of the councillor who is also my ward chair. We have come from a period where the area councillor literally used to sit on my chair to spy on what I was doing (he believed I was getting a lot money from the people I was attending to in the office)…..from the time when he erroneously chaired mitaa meetings (instead of the mitaa chairpersons) thereby leading to daily conflicts and in fights to a time now when we are harmoniously
“I have witnessed a 360 degrees turn-around of the councillor who is also my ward chair. We have come from a period where the area councillor literally used to sit on my chair to spy on what I was doing (he believed I was getting a lot money from the people I was attending to in the office).....from the time when he erroneously chaired mitaa meetings (instead of the mitaa chairpersons) thereby leading to daily conflicts and in fights to a time now when we are harmoniously working together both at ward and council levels, when need arises. We are now literally walking together. What a change for the better”!!

The councillors and staff are jointly addressing the concerns and seeking creative strategies of resolving them. There is closer and more professional follow-up on issues and plans. Councillors are listening, seeking and respecting the opinions and advice of council staff. In Mtwara-Mikindani MC for instance, the councillors sought and received prompt services from the Engineer in improving the road which was already approved in the development plan. There is improved intra council solidarity across gender and party divides.

However, there are cases where the council staff do not furnish the councillors with sufficient information especially in instances where they are in acting positions. In Kibaha District Council, where an overwhelming majority of the councillors are new, an uneasy relationship existed between the staff and councillors. The council staff in Karatu District Council, reported continued interference from the councillors notably from the opposition party CHADEMA. The team however, is not sure whether this is purely an interference issue or the councillors are performing their oversight function in a manner not acceptable to all concerned stakeholders.

Another outstanding issue is sustaining and deepening these emerging cordial relationships in light of the relatively large numbers of new councillors. For example in Mtwara-Mikindani out of 20 councillors only three are continuing while in Kabaha District 7 out of 8 councillors are new.

b) Role clarification
Councillors were reported to know the boundaries of their authority. After knowing their roles and responsibilities, the pace and quality of mobilisation, implementation, supervision and monitoring of development initiatives in the various wards has improved. As a result cooperation between councillors and council staff had improved.

However, in Magu District Council, the councillors expressed frustration and hence a need to further assert their presence and roles to the staff in particular within the procurement, recruitment and project implementation supervision processes. There is also reported lack of role definition and clarification between the councillors and District Commissioners’ representatives at ward level (Katibu Tarafa). This was particularly reported in Endabash Ward in Karatu District.

c) Harmonious relationship between the councillors and WDC
There is reported reduced conflict between the councillors and chairpersons of villages and mtaas who constitute the WDC. Similarly there was reported reduced interference between councillors and the staff at the ward level including WEOs and VEOs. For example in Upanga East, in Ilala MC, the WEO and councillor are jointly making follow-ups to access services and facilities (like a caterpillar to open
roads and drains) from the MC. There is hence improved pace and efficiency in the implementation of projects at ward level (see below).

The WDCs reported either lack of or delayed action on priorities identified by the wards by the councils. In Karatu Mjini Ward, Bwawani primary school was constructed on community initiative on the understanding and agreement that the council will provide the roofing materials. However, the council delayed to provide the materials and the school wall collapsed. Similarly in Vigaeni Ward in Mtwara Mikindani MC, the local leaders recommended that both the council and government should not promise what they cannot deliver because it makes the public lose confidence in them as leaders.

d) Improved understanding of working procedures under a multi-party system
The levels of councillors’ political tolerance of councillors from other political parties were reported to have improved. For example in Karatu District Council, there were no explicit signs of disunity when the team met and discussed with the councillors. This was reported to have brought about harmony between councillors from different political parties and between elected and special seats councillors.

However, in Karatu District where the opposition party (CHADEMA) is dominant with 10 out of the 18 councillors, the executives reported numerous cases of interference due to political party affiliations. In one case, the CHADEMA councillors were reported to have demanded that the CHADEMA manifesto be implemented as opposed to the nationally approved Chama Cha Mapinduzi (CCM) manifesto. In Vingunguti Ward of Ilala MC, whereas the councillor is a member of CCM, all the mtaa chairpersons were from the opposition and the councillor reported that this poses some challenges in day to day practical work dynamics and relations.

Practical mechanisms of orientating councillors to operate under multi-party system should be specifically given to councils with multiple party representations to complement the training. The councillors will acknowledge that the parties are simply vehicles that enable them to go to council for them to undertake their mandates for the benefit of their constituents and development in general.

e) Improved performance of the legislative function
The councillors were reported to have improved their ability to make bye-laws that are supported by the community and in line with laws and regulations. In Kibaha District Council, it was reported that the previous council made two bye-laws after the training. The councils also have the capacity to scrutinise for consistency with the national and LG laws, the bye-laws proposed by the WDCs. Instances were reported where councillors were quoting relevant sections of laws and regulations to support their arguments. They were thus able to inform each other that if we pass this bye-law it will be in conflict with a particular section of another law and regulation.
However, some councillors were reported reluctant to communicate the implications of the bye-laws to the constituents. For example in Magu and Karatu districts, some of the councillors were reluctant to inform their constituents that they have to contribute towards the implementation of projects (like secondary schools and health projects) within their communities.

f) **Downward accountability to the constituents**

Councillors reported to be informing the community members the councils’ decisions as part of operationalizing the concept of good governance. In some councils, it was reported that the community members are allowed and encouraged to attend full council meetings. In other cases, the councillors communicate the council decisions through WDC and village/mtaa meetings.

As a result, many community projects and programmes have been initiated and implemented in communities. There are also joint follow-ups between WEOs and councillors that have enabled them to access services from the councils.

The above notwithstanding, there are instances like in Sepeko ward of Monduli District where WDC members especially those recently elected complained that they do not receive sufficient feedback from their councillor. Similar sentiments were expressed by residents of Kisungule Ward in Mtwara-Mikindani MC. Yet the civil society is not empowered to demand for accountability from their councillors. CBOs and NGOs members discussed with also confirmed that the dissemination of council decisions is minimal though reportedly improving as NGOs are currently participating in WDC meetings.

There are also cases where the councillors and WEOs are not furnished with enough information from the council staff especially with regard to the specifications, costs and implementation schedules of projects in their wards. Indeed, the situation at the ward level is captured by the quote below.

> “Here, the municipal council only recognizes the significant role of the chairperson of mtaa when a problem arises. I strongly feel that, there is need to empower the mtaa chairpersons to enable them effectively and meaningfully participate in decision making processes and discharging of their duties. Can you imagine as a mtaa official, I am the minister for security, agriculture, health, education, conflict resolution, water, citizen registry data bank’ yet I have no office, no allowance (posho), no budget and I am supposed to register all people in my mtaa and attend to all the issues in my area”.

The training enabled the councillors to comprehend and fully appreciate the wide range of functions and responsibilities that are bestowed on them. Some of the councillors who cannot read and write realised the high demands of their work and opted not to stand again. For example the councillor of Namanga ward in Monduli District
Council was reported to have declined to stand for re-election because of his inability to read and write.

Some of the councillors lamented that because of the complexity of their roles, there is need to set the minimum academic qualifications for one to stand as a councillor beyond the provisions in the current law which requires the knowledge to read and write in either Kiswahili or English.

3.4.3 Role of councillors in service delivery

The training had exposed councillors to participatory approaches in identifying, implementation and monitoring of development initiatives. Council and regional authorities acknowledged that councillors’ performance and participation in the council development activities had improved substantially since they attended training. The councillors reported to have appreciated that development is not entirely the responsibility of government, but rather a concerted effort by communities as well as other stakeholders. They thus sensitised and mobilised community members to participate fully in all the project cycle stages. Consequently, the councillors sensitised and mobilised the community members on the need to participate in the planning, implementation and management of social and economic services and facilities. Text box 5: below provides some examples of councillors’ involvement in development activities.

Text box 5:
Councillors involvement in development activities

Examples of Councillors’ involvement in development activities:
- Upanga East Ward of Ilala Municipal Council, the councillor reported to have mobilised community members and donor agencies to contribute resources for the construction of the drainage system.
- In Chanika Ward of Ilala Municipal Council, the informants reported that the councillor was very active in the mobilisation of citizens in the construction of a secondary school.
- In Sepeko ward, Monduli District the councillor was reported to have participated in school inspections leading to improved pupil performance. For example the ward produced the best pupil in Arusha region. He is now mobilising the community to start the construction of a secondary school which hitherto has been non-existent in the ward.
- In Mlandizi Ward, Kibaha District, the councillor mobilised the community to construct four new primary schools. In addition they constructed a dispensary with support from TASAF.
- In Vigaeni Ward, Mtwara-Mikindani MC, they have initiated and built a police station, a primary and secondary school, and dispensary. In addition through an inter ward initiative they have been able to rehabilitate a 5 km road that have reduced the distance from the initial 20 km. The initially difficult to reach six villages are now linked by all weather roads.
- In Mtwara-Mikindani MC, they originally had two secondary schools, but through the skills in community mobilisation and skills of working together, seven schools have been constructed.

3.4.4 Roles in management and control of LG finances

a) Participation in local revenue mobilisation

Councilors have the ability to identify sources of revenue and to participate in mobilization of revenue collection as well as overseeing revenue administration. In Ilala MC, the councillors reported that after the training they could on one hand explain to the community
members the relationship between payment of taxes and service delivery and on the other intensify the supervision of local revenue collection efforts. They had formed revenue mobilisation sub-committees. In Karatu District Council, Mwanza CC and Mtwara-Mikindani MC, the councillors reported that they had privatised some of the revenue sources leading to an increase in the absolute amounts of revenue collected.

Text box 6:

Case study of revenue mobilisation effort

In Mwanza CC, councillors resolved to borrow from central government Tshs 800,000,000/= in order to survey 60,000 plots and sell them on the open market28. The sale did not only raise money for the council but even more importantly it helped to curb the corruption that was endemic in the lands department. By April 2005, the plots were surveyed and within three months all of them had been sold. The prices ranged from 450,000; 720,000; to 820,000; and 1,200,000 to 1,500,000 for high, medium and low density plot respectively. Additionally 3,000 plots are expected to be put on the open market by the end of May 2006. In the process corruption in the lands department is reported to have reduced and general complaints had significantly come down.

In the same Mwanza CC, also decided to be setting aside Tshs 200,000,000/= every six months as a forced savings for their priority initiatives. Through this initiative, the Council has rehabilitated the following roads: Posta road, Pamba, Station and Mahakama. The MCC has also bought two fire fighting vehicles each costing Tshs 600,000,000/=.

3.4.5 Crosscutting Issues

Under this section we include behavioural issues that cut across the above themes.

a) Improved gender mainstreaming

Gender mainstreaming was reported to have improved at the council and ward levels. For example, councillors were reported to be having the knowledge and skills of analysing, reviewing and adding gender sensitive elements into budgets prepared by the council staff. The female councillors in particular were reported to be expressing themselves better and articulating issues that concern both men and women as opposed to the previous practice where they mainly expressed issues exclusively concerning women.

---

28 The idea of borrowing directly originated from the delivery of module 4.
As a result, more holistic developments are now taking place within the councils and there are in particular increased numbers of women economic groups that are engaged in socio-economic activities. This was certainly the case in Kisungule Ward in Mtwara-Mikindani MC.

There is however need to increase the number of popularly elected female councillors that may eventually take on key positions in the council as well as deepening the gender agenda.

b) Use of skills by councillors not re-elected

Both the current and non re-elected councillors reported that the non re-elected councillors are still using the skills acquired from the training in their respective communities. The former councillors for Vigaeni Ward in Mtwara-Mikindani MC and Chanika Ward in Ilala MC are being pro-actively sought after and are providing quality advise and support to the new leadership and community at large. They were in particular reported to be attending and guiding village and mtaa meetings. “It is Government policy for all citizens to be involved in community initiatives. So I get involved in my capacity as an ordinary citizen but I am recognized and I actually act as a resource person”, former Councilor Chanika Ward, Ilala Municipal Council. Similar sentiments were raised by the former Mayor of Mtwara-Mikindani, who after ten years of being in the office did not seek re-election. In Karatu Mjini Ward, the former councilor was reported very instrumental in helping the farmers that had lost their land to regain it.

Councillors not re-elected challenge the elected councillors and make them perform. In Kibaha District Council, where an overwhelming number is of newly elected councillors, they reported to be getting a lot of informal guidance and orientation from their predecessors.

Nonetheless, there is no systematic follow-up and monitoring on how the non re-elected councillors are using the skills and knowledge acquired. There is need to put in place a predictable hand-over of power mechanisms that will ensure that institutional memory is not lost.

c) Meeting of minimum conditions and performance measures

The councils are required to meet a set of minimum requirements in order to be eligible to access the development grants provided under the LGCDG system. The councillors reported that they are mounting a lot of pressure to the council staff to ensure that they perform and meet the set conditions. In Monduli District Council for example, it was reported that the District did not meet the minimum requirements during the assessment conducted in April 2005 for accessing the LGCDG for financial year 2005/06. As such, the council passed a resolution that they should ensure that all the minimum requirements are met to access subsequent LGCDG transfers. During the discussion with the council staff, it was reported that the indications of meeting the requirements for the recently concluded assessment
(April 2006) are positive as per the tentative findings presented to them during the debriefing session after the assessment.

Both Magu and Mtwar-Mikindani councils, reported to have addressed most of the areas of concern that made them fail to access the CDG in the previous year and are now confident that they will meet the requirements and access the CDG.

d) **Analysis of arrangements for sustaining the benefits**

In addition to the training provided through the national programme, there are a number of other mechanisms through which both the process and outputs of the training can be sustained. For example, the Strategic Plan for ALAT includes training of councillors and staff in collaboration with development partners, LGRP and PMO-RALG\textsuperscript{29}. ALAT provides a forum for exchanging views and experiences among members of LGAs on advocacy on policy and legislative matters likely to affect LGAs. It further provides a medium of dissemination of information and offers expert advice. In addition, it makes representation and proposals to the government and represents LGAs and their views in international forums. The main funding of ALAT comes from membership subscriptions. Therefore, ALAT needs to build its capacities to be able to effectively undertake its role of representations, lobbying and advocacy and services provision to its members including institutionalizing training.

The LGs were also found to be allocating some of their CBG provided under the LGCDG to skills training of councillors and other capacity building activities. For example, the capacity building plan for Monduli District Council of 2005/06 provided for the training of councillors in their roles on revenue collection, team work and management of ward tribunals. This need was identified as a capacity gap during the annual assessment conducted in 2005. Similarly, in Kibaha District Council, the CBG was used to orient the newly elected councillors on their roles in January 2006.

\textsuperscript{29} Refer to the ALAT Medium Term Strategic Implementation Plan 2005/06 – 2007/08, Key Result Area 6: Capacity Building
4.0 SUMMARY OF LESSONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 Improving the Next Round of Councillor Training in Tanzania

Under this section, we present suggestions on how the next round of national programme for the councillors’ training in Tanzania should be organized and delivered to ensure the attainment of the desired objectives. The recommendations are derived from the findings and analysis made in chapter three. Whilst allowing room for flexibility, an attempt is also made to organize the recommendations in the sequence in which they are proposed to be implemented.

a) The scope of the training
The TIE concluded that the training covered the actual needs and expectations of the councillors. In addition it was concluded that the councillors appreciated both the knowledge and skills aspects of the training. It is thus proposed that the next round of training for the newly elected councillors cover the same scope as was covered in the previous training. The evaluation however noted that some laws, rules, structures, regulations and policies have since then changed. These changes will have to be taken on board.

b) The training materials
Whereas it was reported that some of the training materials have been affected by policy and administrative changes and others lack in detail, the process of revising and overhauling the current set of materials is pre-mature given that they were developed and used only two years ago. It is therefore proposed to:

- Check the existing materials for consistency with the laws and practices;
- Prepare an addendum to the existing training materials to cater for the recent policy and administrative changes as well as improvements that may have emerged during the delivery of the previous training. Focus should mainly be on financial management, procurement and communication;
- Prepare a module giving an overview of the whole training programme to be delivered to both the continuing and new councillors at the end of the training as a refresher programme and to facilitate team building and peer learning;
- Explore possibilities of printing the training materials in a durable and robust but flexible format that easily allows insertion and deletion.
- In addition to the personalized sets of materials to be given to the councillors, also make provision for adequate copies that will be readily accessible for general use at both council and ward levels.

c) The regional trainers
The trainers in the previous training were reported to have been knowledgeable, possessing hands-on experience in LGA operations
and also adhering to the guidelines. It is therefore proposed that the trainers that delivered the previous training, where practical be maintained. To complement their effectiveness, it is further proposed that:

- Regional trainers be allowed to facilitate across regions for complementing each others skills and knowledge and to ensure cross regional learning;
- Regional trainers meet periodically (for example after the delivery of a module or two) to compare notes and share experiences;
- Mechanisms of using some of the trained councillors to share their practical experiences during the delivery of the training be explored.
- More specialized experts be called in to make specific inputs into areas such as financial management,

d) The training strategy and methods
The trainers and councillors alike considered the mix of residential and distance learning as well as a wide range of adult learning methods used as being effective in the transfer of both knowledge and skills. It is therefore proposed to continue using both the strategy and methods used in the delivery of the previous training. The above notwithstanding, it is proposed that:

- The trainers should elicit active and equitable participation of both female and male councillors;
- The LGAs should be encouraged to complement the national programme of councillors training with other strategies for the transfer of skills to the councillors like exposure and exchange visits. Such activities could be financed by the CBG provided under the LGCDG system.

e) The target group
Whereas the TIE established wide variations in the level of education of the councillors, it proposed to maintain the target group, hence jointly training female and male councillors. In particular, it is proposed that:

- The training targets all the newly elected councillors and those that joined the previous training at module 4 stage.
- Councillors be clustered at say regional levels depending on the numbers involved (maximum 30 participants per training group);
- The councils should be advised to in build within their respective capacity building plans activities where the councillors directly interface with the council management team for better internalisation of their relationships (in-house and tailored made sessions).

f) Training duration and timing
The duration of the previous training was reported to have been tight especially because the time allocated to distance learning was not effectively used. All stakeholders had strong reservations to the timing of the training as having been delivered too late to have the desired
impact on the performance of the councillors. It is hence proposed that:

- The training of the newly elected councillors be launched early enough during their tenure preferably before the end of 2006;
- Maintain the duration of the training but elicit interest and commitment in the use of time allocated for distance learning. This could be done through for example closer follow-ups by the CLP and RTs.

g) Administrative and logistical issues
Despite the variances in the quality of the venues, the councillors reported that the selected venues were conducive for adult learning. In addition, the councillors liked to be paid allowances during the residential training. It is therefore proposed that:

- The councillors interests and preference be considered during the selection of the venue so long as they are within the recommended price ceilings;
- Preferably the venue should be outside office and residential locations to avoid the normal disturbances;
- Maintain the structure and level of allowances in real terms (may need to adjust for inflation).

h) Monitoring and backstopping arrangements
Whereas a wide range of stakeholders were involved in monitoring and ensured that the training was delivered at acceptable levels of quality, the lack of explicitly stated overall objectives of the training affected effectiveness of monitoring. It is therefore proposed that:

- The overall objectives, expected outcomes, impact as well as objectively verifiable indicators and means of verifications for the next round of training be clearly stated and disseminated to guide the effective monitoring of the training process, outputs, outcomes and impact. These could be presented in logical framework arrangement;
- The monitoring process should cover post training periods and should not be parallel but rather linked and/or integrated with the other existing or proposed M&E systems. For example the M&E system for training being developed by PO-Public Service and Management as well as the annual assessment of LGA performance.
- The stakeholders previously involved in the monitoring process should continue but in this case guided by a pre-agreed monitoring framework. Among other factors they should monitor the effectiveness of the process, acquisition of knowledge and skills as well as improvements in job performance and organizational effectiveness.
4.2 Institutionalising Training: Lessons from the Councillors Training

**Background:** Training is one of the strategies undertaken by a wide range of organisations as a means of improving the performance of their human resources to attain the overall organisational goals and vision. However, in a number of cases the training activities neither lead to the desired improvements nor are the improvements systematically measured and documented. One of the lessons from the TIE of the National Programme of Councillors Training in Tanzania is that a number of mutually reinforcing factors/features described below are prerequisites and should be in built in a training programme for it to be institutionalised and to have the desired impact on individual performance as well as organisational effectiveness. It should however be noted that the entry points could vary depending on the requirements of the different contexts.

Under this section therefore we use the lessons (both positive and negative) from the TIE of the National Programme of Councillors Training in Tanzania to highlight the interdependent features/prerequisites for the institutionalisation and maximization of the impact of the training programmes.

**Principles:** Before these features/prerequisites are discussed, it is worth mentioning that:

- The prerequisites, lessons and articulations below need to be customised to suit the different political, social and economic contexts.
- To achieve the desired results/impact, there is need for collective action at the different levels including international, national, LG and community as well as stakeholders including public, NGO and private sectors.
- Whereas the iterative and ‘web’ like process analysis presented here below solely draws from the experiences of the councillors’ training in Tanzania (and not the broad capacity building processes in Tanzania), it can be tailored and widely used by national, bilateral, multi-lateral and NGO programmes in various contexts.

a) Political Commitment

In place there should be conducive policies, guidelines and political pronouncements to facilitate planning, delivery and application of the knowledge and skills attained from the training. Such conducive guidelines and policies need to be specific and directly related to the training programme. In addition, the other policies, procedures and guidelines should not hinder and/or contradict the programme process and results. In the Tanzanian case, the Development Vision 2025, the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty, Policy Paper on the LG Reforms among others were conducive for the delivery and use of the knowledge and skills acquired by the councillors from the training.

---

30 This lesson is in line with the process of institutionalizing gender in policy and planning: the ‘web’ of institutionalization by Caren Levy, March 1996.
b) Availability of financial resources
It is also important to have the financial resources to meet the costs for preparations, delivery as well as backstopping, quality control and monitoring of the training programme. In addition to the resources earmarked for the training programme, it is also important to have other resources that can be used to complement the earmarked resources. In Tanzania, the training programme was collectively funded by a number of donors through a basket fund arrangement. In addition, the councils have access to the CBG under the LGCDG system that could be used among other things for skills development of the councillors.

c) Institutional mandate for training and capacity building
There is need to have in place an institution mandated to provide the training. Such an institution should have effective coordination and collaboration arrangements with stakeholders not only in the public sector but also in the private and NGO sectors. The training programme should also be integrated into all activities of key stakeholders. In Tanzania, the PMO-RALG through the LGRP was responsible for delivering the training and closely collaborated with the regional secretariats, councils, NGOs (like SAEU) and private trainers.

d) Identification of the training needs
The process of identifying the capacity needs to be addressed by the training programme should be highly participatory and interactive borrowing from practical experiences. Hence, there should be wide consultation of stakeholders up to the grassroots, special focus on the peculiar needs by gender, class, ethnicity, geographical location and also a need to analyze the gaps beyond knowledge and skills to systems/procedures as well as tools. In the Tanzania’s case, the LGRP commissioned SAEU to conduct a comprehensive needs assessment to identify the specific needs of councillors considering geographical, education as well as gender disparities.

e) Determining the training content
The training content should be sufficient in scope, detail and correctness and consistent with laws and practices to address all the identified gaps and potential and realistic participant’s expectations. The content for the councillors training covered the full range of roles and responsibilities that are both statutory and non-statutory in nature as well as those of the council in general.

f) Development of training materials
In order to develop training materials to meet the objectives of the training and suit the learning needs of adults, there is need to constitute a competent and multi-disciplinary team and orient the constituted team to the requirements and expected outputs of the training. In addition, there is need to have in place quality control arrangements and progressive consultations. The materials also need to be practically tested for clarity, comprehensiveness, consistence with the policies and laws before they are signed off for use by the mandated institution. The materials should then be printed in a
durable form and widely distributed for both personalized use by the trainees as well as for easy access by the other stakeholders not directly covered by the training.

g) Trainers/Facilitators
There is need to define and agree on the profiles of the trainers including their knowledge and experience before they are selected. The trainers should be both women and men of varied complementary experiences and skills with a passion for training. The trainers need to be orientated to the training materials and processes to ensure that they have a common understanding and vision. In addition they should be provided with a practical training guide for use during the delivery of the training. The team of trainers should possess ample skills mix and opportunities and should be well provided for progressive experience sharing and comparison of notes. Training should be incorporated in the job schedules of staff and there should be inbuilt in-house mechanism of transferring skills to other staff to broaden the knowledge base for developing the culture of training.

h) Training strategy and methods
There is need to use a mix of strategies and methods, combining the knowledge and skills aspects of performance. The training strategies should be mainstreamed in the organizational budgets to ensure the sustainability of both the process and outputs. In Tanzania, whereas the national programme for councillors training was delivered in a supply-driven manner, the GoT has started a process of transferring CBGs to LGAs to finance demand-driven capacity building activities of which skills development for councillors is eligible.

i) Target group and attendance
It is of paramount importance to ensure that the target group has similarities in roles as well as qualities. There should also be mechanisms through which the participants account to the constituents and for the constituents to demand accountability from the trainees (councillors). In selecting the target group, there should be effective representation in terms of gender, class, age, ethnicity and political affiliation. In order to attain high levels of attendance, the participants should be motivated to learn through the delivery of the relevant content, selection of appropriate delivery methods and provision of good logistics and material incentives.

j) Duration and timing
The training programme should be delivered when there is ample time for the trainees to implement the acquired knowledge and skills. The duration should be sufficient to allow for in-depth discussion of the presented topics

“When asked about timing of the training, it was unanimously stated that by the time of the training, people were already focusing on the election and therefore paid little attention to the training. This was expressively put in Swahili “kisomo kilikuja jioni”, literary meaning, “the training came in the evening when people are tired”!
k) The training venue
The venue selected for training should be conducive for adult learning including provision of enough space for group discussions, quiet, clean and providing privacy especially to the female participants. The proximity of the venue to the working station of the trainees is an important factor that should be considered.

l) Changing the organisation culture
There is need within the organisation to ensure that the opportunities are provided for the trainees to practically apply the knowledge and skills acquired from the training. If the skills are not used they will be forgotten.

m) Monitoring and evaluation
There is need to determine the objectives for the training programme, indicators and means of verification during the preparatory phase as a basis for the subsequent monitoring activities. Monitoring should then be conducted throughout the training process using a mix of methods from the pre-training stage, during and immediately after the training (to determine the participants reaction to the training), individuals at the work place (to determine job behaviour and performance) and at the organisation level (to determine organizational effectiveness and impact on human settlements). The lessons and experiences from the monitoring and evaluation exercises should be well documented and widely disseminated as a mechanism of providing feedback and soliciting continued support and interest. It should also be ensured that the lessons are used for replication to other programmes, for informing policy refinement and for contributing to theory building.

4.3 Overall Assessment

The national programme for councillors training faced some systemic challenges especially the absence of clear objectives and monitoring framework. In addition, there were operational challenges notably the delays faced during the delivery stage.

The above notwithstanding, the preparation and delivery process were generally sound. As a result, the training was able to greatly contribute towards the improved performance of the councillors and the council’s attainment of their mandates. The TIE team therefore concluded that the training was an investment worth making.

It is therefore recommended that the training should be provided to the newly elected councillors and those that joined at module 4 stage in the previous training. For continuing councillors, a fast tracked refresher module should be provided jointly with the new councillors at the end of the next round of training. The training processes and outputs should further be institutionalised through mainstreaming them with the respective council human resource development plans and budgets. All the plans should be effectively disseminated at all levels and on regular basis. Further, enhanced roles of the MMOs and ALAT in future training programmes should be explored and their respective capacities built to undertake the envisaged new roles. The central role of information and communication should also be accentuated.
Annex 1: References

1. IFAD, 2005, IFAD’s Performance and Impact in Decentralizing Environments: Experiences from Ethiopia, Tanzania and Uganda: Agreement at Completion Point


4. Monduli District Council; Local Government Support Programme, Capacity Building Plan for the year 2005/06


7. SAEU; Final Report for the Consultancy to Provide Monitoring and Quality Control Services for the National Programme for Councillors Training

8. Stergomena Tax and Volker Hauck, 2003, Sector-wide Approaches and Decentralisation Towards Greater Policy Coherence: The Case of Tanzania


12. The United Republic of Tanzania: The Local Authority (Elections) Act, 1979: with amendments up to 30th June, 2005


14. UNDP, 2006, Country Assessment Practice Note

16. UN-HABITAT & The University of Manchester, 2005, Making Learning Matter: Training Impact on Performance

17. UN-HABITAT, 2003, Monitoring and Evaluation Guide

18. UN-HABITAT, Decentralization of Local Government in East Africa

## Annex 2: The Work Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| March 16, 2006  | • Initial briefing with UN-HABITAT Nairobi  
                  • Telephone briefing with the LGRP                                                                                                     |
| March 20 – 25, 2006 | • Start review of documents  
                     • Design of the draft methodology and tools  
                     • Meeting with DPU                                                                                                                     |
| April 17, 2006  | • Travel to Dar es Salaam                                                                                                                  |
| April 18, 2006  | • Initial meeting with the LGRP  
                  • Meeting with ALAT  
                  • Meeting with SAEU                                                                                                                     |
| April 19, 2006  | • Discussion with ZRT Dar es Salaam  
                  • Meeting with Councillors in Ilala Municipality  
                  • Meeting with middle level staff of Ilala Municipal Council                                                                      |
| April 20, 2006  | • Meeting in Chanika and Vingunguti Wards of Ilala MC                                                                                      |
| April 21, 2006  | • Meeting in Ilala and Upanga East Wards of Ilala MC  
                  • Meeting with CMT (HoDs) of Ilala Municipal Council                                                                                   |
| April 22, 2006  | • Meeting with LGRP  
                  • TIP e-forum (share Inception Report)                                                                                                    |
| April 23, 2006  | • Travel to Mwanza (Elijah)  
                  • Travel to Arusha (Emmanuel & Deborah)                                                                                            |
| April 24, 2006  | • Meetings in Mwanza City Council (Elijah)  
                  • Meetings in Monduli District (Emmanuel & Deborah)                                                                                   |
| April 25, 2006  | • Meetings in two Wards of Mwanza City Council (Elijah)  
                  • Meetings in two Wards of Monduli District (Emmanuel & Deborah)                                                                     |
| April 26, 2006  | • Meeting with Regional Trainers in Mwanza (Elijah)  
                  • Meeting with Regional Trainers in Arusha  
                  • Travel to Karatu (Emmanuel & Deborah)                                                                                               |
| April 27, 2006  | • Meetings in Magu District Council (Elijah)  
                  • Meetings in Karatu District Council (Emmanuel & Deborah)                                                                            |
| April 28, 2006  | • Meetings in two Wards of Magu District Council (Elijah)  
                  • Meetings in two Wards of Karatu District Council (Emmanuel & Deborah)                                                                     |
| April 29, 2006  | • Travel to Dar es Salaam                                                                                                                  |
| April 30, 2006  | • Review findings in Dar (All team members)                                                                                               |
| May 1, 2006     | • Review findings in Dar (All team members)  
                  • Travel to Mtwara (Elijah)                                                                                                               |
| May 2, 2006     | • Meetings in Mtwara/Mkindani Municipal Council (Elijah)  
                  • Meetings in Kibaha District Council (Emmanuel & Deborah)  
                  • Quantitative data entry and analysis (Emmanuel, Deborah & Statistician)                                                                |
| May 3, 2006     | • Meetings in two Wards of Mtwara/Mkindani Municipal Council (Elijah)  
                  • Meetings in two Wards of Kibaha District Council (Emmanuel & Deborah)  
                  • Travel to Dar (Elijah)                                                                                                               |
| May 4, 2006     | • Follow-up meetings (All team members)  
                  • Prepare for debriefing (All team members)                                                                                             |
| May 5, 2006     | • Follow-up meetings (All team members)  
                  • Debriefing with the LGRP, UN-HABITAT and other stakeholders (Afternoon)                                                                     |
| May 6, 2006     | • Travel to Nairobi, Kampala and Dodoma                                                                                                     |
| May 10, 2006    | • Submit the draft report  
                  • Reflections on lessons learnt & TIP e-forum                                                                                           |
| May 15, 2006    | • Receive and discussing comments on the draft report in Nairobi                                                                              |
| May 22, 2006    | • Submit final report                                                                                                                      |
## Annex 3: Sampled Local Government Authorities and the Sampling Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District/Municipal</th>
<th>Sampling Criteria</th>
<th>Wards</th>
<th>Sampling Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Ilala Municipal Council            | • Dar-es-salaam region/Zone  
• Urban Council  
• Majority of the Councillors newly elected (but CCM) | Chanika     | • Largest-15 Mitaa  
• Rural-Peri-urban  
• New Councillor |
|                                    |                                                                                    | Vingunguti  | • Low income  
• Densely populated  
• Poor services  
• All new mtaa chairpersons and from CUF political party |
|                                    |                                                                                    | Upanga East | • Purely urban;  
• Planned area;  
• 2 mtaa  
• All new chairpersons |
|                                    |                                                                                    | Ilala       | • Planned  
• 3 out of 4 mtaa chairpersons newly elected |
| Karatu District                    | • Arusha region/zone  
• Rural Council  
• Mix of CCM and CHADEMA | Karatu Mjini | • Town ward in a rural district  
• Councilor and village chairpersons CHADEMA  
• Rural ward |
|                                    |                                                                                    | Endabash    | • Rural Ward; |
| Kibaha District                    | • Coast Region  
• Dar-es-salaam zone  
• Rural and heavily populated  
• Majority newly elected councillors (control case)  
• Small council  
• CCM dominated council | Soga Ward    | • One re-elected village chairperson |
|                                    |                                                                                    | Mlandizi Ward | • Rural Township;  
• All village chairpersons CCM |
| Magu District                      | • Mwanza region/zone  
• Rural Council;  
• Among 38 districts that pioneered reforms.  
• Close to city of Mwanza | Sukuma      | • A rural ward with 4 villages with a pop with low level of education.  
• A new Cllr. The former one didn’t seek re-election |
|                                    |                                                                                    | Magu Mjini  | • Close collaboration among WDC staff and residents |
| Mtwar-Mikindani Municipal Council  | • Mtwara region/zone  
• Recent upgrading to Municipal Council  
• Majority newly elected(10 out of 13)  
• “Marginalised area” needing special attention  
• “Home” of reforms | Vigaeni     | • Close to CBD  
• Cordial relationship between former cllr and the new one |
|                                    |                                                                                    | Kisungule   | • Marginalized & rural in character  
• Former slave trading market  
• Active women Economic groups |
### Annex 3: Sampled Local Government Authorities and the Sampling Criteria

| Monduli District | • Arusha Region/Zone  
| Pastoral Communities  
| Rural Council | Sepeko Ward | • Councillor attended training  
| • All WDC members CCM  
| Urban ward in rural district | Monduli Mjini | • Specific targeting of NGOs  
| • Old councillors |

| Mwanza City Council | • Mwanza region/zone  
| Urban Council (City)  
| High growth rate of 11% with a pop of about 550,000.  
| Actively involved in restructuring processes | Milongo | • New councillor  
| Urban ward with rather difficult working relation btwn clrr and WDC members | Bugogwa | • New councillor  
| A larger ward with 32 mitaas |
Annex 4: List of People Met

UN-HABITAT Level

Raf Tuts, Asa Johnson, Angelique Habils, Bridget Oballa, Hawa Diallo, Gulelat Kebede, Martin Barugahare, Teckla Muhoro and Eleni Kyrou (DPU),

National Level

PMO-RALG and Local Government Reform Programme
Maria ..., Brendan GylN, Jack M. Nyakirangi, T.A. Rutahindurwa, Donatina Kileo, Winston Bohela, S. Kahitwa, Edward Mkama, Margaret Nakainga, Jaribu, I.F

Other National Level Stakeholders
Kimaro – ALAT, Philemon Mutta – UN-HABITAT

Regional Administration
Kyanga Estomihin – Arusha, Matuwira, H.I- Mtwara

South African Extension Unit
Nderikyo Liz Ligate, Mathias James Mntangi, Gideon Evans Mfaume

Regional Trainers
Rovin Nguyaine - Arusha, Mrs. Angelina Murangira-Lindi, Dennis J. Mahundu-Lindi, Fredrick M. Ntakabanyula – Mwanza

District/Municipal Councils

1 Ilala Municipal Council

Councillors

Council Management Team

Ilala Ward
Edson Fungo, Omary Yegeyege, Situ Mwasa, Zawadi, Pojo
Vingunguti Ward
Selemani Sultani, Hamidu Stambozi, Saida Haji, Salehe Kibavu, Assaa S. Haruni

Chanika Ward

Upanga East
Rehema Mkumbo, Marco Rweyemamu, Abou Maddy

2 Karatu District

Councillors

Council Management Team

Karatu Mjini Ward

Endabash Ward

3 Kibaha District

Councillors

Council Management Team

Mlandizi Ward
Fedilia S. Swai, Fatuma M. Kisebengo, Ramabhani Samata, A.S. Kizigo, Salumi N. Ngonji, John Pili, Michael C. Mwakamo
Soga Ward
Ramadhani K. Chezeni, Nicephory Mnamba Petro, Omari S. Kibwana, H. Mazala, Rajabu Bago, Taimu R. Halimasi, Kasimu Mpate, Juma M. Mohamedi, Bakaris Liike, Angela Ayasi, Christina A. Mafie

4 Magu District

Councillors

Council Management Team

Sukuma Ward

Magu Ward

5 Mtwara-Mikindani

Councillors
Council Management Team

Fredrick M. Ntakabanyula
Kisungule Ward
Simeon Shija Lduka, Amos Lugisa, Bujanaa Majanga, Time N. Suluba, Alex Luhali, Robert Luzili, Mussa Gervas, Mathias Mukatakona, Simon S. Misalaba, Sebastian Lurona, Triphone Suka, Charles P. Chamba, Lucas

Vigaeni Ward
Dadi M. Dadi, Mohamed Saidi M, Dadi H. Mbulu, Asha M. Nditi, Veronica Boniface, Hamisi I. Sembe, Abdala Mohammed, Juma C. Mzalendo, Juma Komba, Hassani A. Mtondohima, Juma Hamisi, Omar Issa, Waziri Abdala, Gulamu Haji, Faustine Miillanzi

6 Monduli District

Councillors

Council Management Team

Sepeko Ward

Monduli Mjini Ward

7 Mwanza City Council

Councillors

Council Management Team
Milongo Ward

Bugogwa Ward
Annex 5: Terms of Reference

**Title:**
Training Impact Evaluation (TIE) Consultant for the evaluation of the Tanzania National Programme for Councillors Training

**Duration:**
Fifty-two (52) workdays of consultancy spread over the period 15 March-30 June 2006.

**Background:**
The Training and Capacity Building Branch (TCBB) of UN-HABITAT has been supporting local government capacity building for over fifteen years. The primary strategy has been to build partnerships with national training and capacity building institutions, and work with them to undertake strategic planning workshops, development and dissemination of tools, adaptation of training materials to local and national contexts, and support national training activities. As the focal point for local authorities in the UN system, and echoing the work of many institutions throughout the world, UN-HABITAT works to promote capacity building responses to the growing challenges faced by local governments.

This assignment falls within TCBB’s framework of strengthening its focus on training impact on performance (TIP). In October 2005, TCBB organized a workshop in Manchester on ‘Making Learning Matter: Training Impact on Performance.’ Representatives of local government training institutions, local government associations, and academic institutions and support agencies from seventeen countries attended the workshop. It was agreed to establish an interest group to further brainstorm on operationalizing TIP, for further discussion at the World Urban Forum III in Vancouver from 19-23 June 2006. This Forum could also serve as an opportunity to outline future plans to enhance the practice of TIP in local government training institutions.

As a practical effort to evaluate TIP, the assignment will be to assess the impact of the National Programme for Councillors Training, undertaken by the Government of Tanzania through the Prime Minister’s Office – Regional Administration and Local Government (PMO-RALG) in 2003/4. The training was conducted nation-wide through a standardised and phased course designed by the Southern Africa Extension Unit (SAEU), based on four key substantive modules on leadership competencies (covering legal aspects, implementation, services and financing) delivered by a pool of individual trainers. A detailed monitoring and quality control study was prepared by SAEU, describing the design, delivery and – to some extent – impact of the training.

The Local Government Reform Programme (LGRP) of PMO-RALG will serve as the local counterpart in Tanzania for the assignment. The consultant will work in consultation with LGRP as well as the Development Planning Unit (DPU), University Collage London, who will be undertaking a broader assignment on TIP with UN-HABITAT over the same period. DPU’s role in this assignment will be to provide methodological support in
the design of the evaluation, and share the process of undertaking the evaluation through a TIP-e-forum of national training institutes established by the above Manchester meeting.

**OBJECTIVE:**
To conduct an impact evaluation of the above *National Programme for Councillors Training*, undertaken by PMO-RALG, Tanzania. The Consultant will work in close collaboration with LGRP, the relevant officers at the Training and Capacity Building Branch (TCBB) of UN-HABITAT and DPU staff in conducting the evaluation.

**OUTPUTS:**
The major expected outputs are:

1. A description of the methodology used and rationale, as well as and evaluation tools developed/utilized;
2. A summary of training impact evaluation findings based on field data collection;
3. A set of recommendations for strengthening the potential impact on performance of the next round of councillors training for newly elected councillors (elected in December 2005). This training will be held in Tanzania during the second half of 2006; and
4. Feedback of the evaluation approach to the TIP e-forum; final reflection on the lessons learned from this TIE

**TASKS:**
The Consultants will work as team of two, under the overall supervision of relevant staff at TCBB of UN-HABITAT, in close collaboration with LGRP, and in consultation with DPU will be responsible for performing the following tasks:

1. Design the methodology and questionnaires and/or other related tools to be used in undertaking the countrywide evaluation. The evaluation will, among other things, cover the
   (i) learning retention of trained councillors (knowledge, skills and attitudes)
   (ii) training impact on the councillors job performance
   (iii) training impact on organisational effectiveness (LGA – management team)
   (iv) impact on the human settlement themes and processes the councillors work on
2. Provide a plan for the conduct of the evaluation over a one-month period in Tanzania, constituting visits to Dar-es-Salaam for initial briefing and to +/- 8 councils across the country. The selection of councils will be covering
   - At least 4 of the 6 zones of Tanzania
   - A mix of urban and rural councils, larger/smaller councils, high/low densely populated councils, councils close/far from Dar-es-Salaam
   - A mix of 100 % CCM ruled councils and mixed CCM/ opposition ruled councils
• Different degrees of authority of local government (according to funds and decentralization phases)

Interviews will be scheduled with all stakeholders. This will include the local government management team, the trained pool of councillors, original pool of individual trainers, the training programme designers (SAEU), ALAT, as well as local citizens intended to benefit from the councillors’ strengthened competencies (e.g. representatives from village assemblies/wards and CBO members). The scheduled interviews should be comprehensive in nature. The selection and scheduling of interviewees will be prepared with assistance of LGRP in Dar-es-Salaam and the zonal offices in the country.


4. Provide regular feedback (once every two weeks) of the evaluation approach, to the above TIP- e-forum co-ordinated by the DPU. This will also include responding to questions that may arise from members of the e-forum group specifically regarding the evaluation in Tanzania.

5. Prepare a final report, which will include an outline of the methodology used, a summary of the findings and a set of recommendations to maximise the impact of the next round of national training scheduled closely after the submission of the report. The report will include:

   • The evaluation of the effectiveness of the design of the training programme with regard to:
     (v) its methodological approach
     (vi) the accessibility and relevance of content of individual modules to the training target group
     (vii) the adequacy of objectives and coverage of the combined set of modules, and the balance between them

   • An assessment of the impact of the training on
     (viii) the individual councillors in their representational roles
     (ix) the improvement of the council day to day work (regarding both the organisational effectiveness of the LGA and the current human settlement themes and processes in the municipality)

   • Recommendations – if applicable – on the further strengthening of the training programme in its forthcoming delivery to the group of newly elected councillors (approximately 1/3 of the councillors are newly elected). While the recommendations will serve as guidance for the delivery of the next training and balance of components, the training manual texts themselves will not be reedited.

6. Submit any questionnaires or other evaluation tools/supplements developed and/or used during the evaluation to TCBB of UN-HABITAT.

7. Prepare a final reflection on the lessons learned from this TIE to TCBB and the above TIP- e-forum. Some questions for those reflections:
   • What linkages could be drawn between the programme for councillors training and the decentralisation process in Tanzania?
• Are there any recommendations to be made to ensure provision of training beyond/in addition to the newly elected councillor’s programme? What modalities, if any, could such capacity building efforts include (this may range from class room training to other forms of support such as exchange programmes etc)

• Describe the linkages between local government training activities/programmes, institutions (government and non-governmental) involved in training local government staff, and the decentralisation process in Tanzania. What recommendations can be made, if any, to further strengthen the response to any training needs of Tanzanian local government staff in the long term?

**Key resources:**
In undertaking the assignment, the consultants may draw, amongst others, on the following four key resources:

1. A set of seven national manuals (in Swahili) published by PMO-RALG and used for the 2003 *National Programme for Councillors Training*;

**Duration:**
The assignment will be undertaken for a total of 52 workdays, split equally by two consultants (26 workdays each) during the period 15 March-30 June 2006. The first 10 workdays (5 days per consultant) will be spent preparing the methodology and related questionnaires for the evaluation, and scheduling meetings/interviews, to be finalised by 31 March. This will include a 1-2 day/s meeting in Nairobi on 16-17 March for initial briefing and agreement on the co-ordination of tasks between the two consultants. The next set of workdays (30 in total; 15 per consultant) will be spent in Tanzania conducting interviews and compiling information during April/early May. The last workdays (8 in total; 4 per consultant), during end May/early June will be spent finalizing the report including recommendations for strengthening the next round of councillor training in Tanzania. In addition to this, 4 workdays (2 per consultant) will be spent reporting to the TIP e-forum. The final evaluation report, including a description of the methodology used, and the final e-forum reflections are expected to be completed and submitted to UN-HABITAT at the end of the assignment.

**Experience:**
Advanced university degree in a field related to public sector management and human settlement development. Minimum of 7 years experience in the field of local governance in East Africa. The consultants should have significant experience in conducting evaluations at the national level, including evaluations related to local governments. They should ideally have experience in training design, training material development, adult
learning methodology, planning and implementation within the public sector and with national training institutes and local government authorities, preferably in the East Africa region. Fluency in English and Swahili is a requirement.

Payment:
The total duration of the consultancy will be 52 work days over a period of three and a half months (15 March-30 June 2006). Fees for the two consultants will be paid in two instalments each: 50 percent upon completion and submission of Tasks 1 and 2; and the remaining 50 percent upon completion of the evaluation, feedback to the e-forum, and submission of the final report (Tasks 3-6) to the satisfaction of UN-HABITAT and LGRP. In addition, UN-HABITAT will cover the international travel cost to/from Tanzania and DSA for the period of stay in Tanzania. LGRP will provide and arrange for in-country travel for the consultants, as well as for allowances for the interviewees.
Annex 6: TIE methodology and tools/questionnaires:

1 General Methodological Notes

a) Information was collected using a wide range of methods and tools including review of secondary data, Key Informant Interviews (KII), Focus Group Discussion (FGDs) as well as Self Administered Questionnaires.

b) Attempts were made to ensure a balance between male and female respondents. Under the self administered questionnaire, the sex of the respondent was recorded and the analysis of findings was disaggregated by gender.

c) Similar information was collected from a number of sources using the various methods to ensure comprehensiveness and for triangulation purposes.

d) The consultants used the issues in the Interview Guide as a basis for probing and getting an in-depth understanding of the responses regarding the impact of training on performance as experienced and/or perceived by the informants, the organizational environments where they work and the communities they are expected to serve on the basis of their mandate.

e) The qualitative responses from the KII and FGDs were complemented with documented evidence from secondary data as well as quantitative data collected from the trained councillors using the self administered/structured questionnaire.

f) The interview guide was used flexibly and was further customized to each category of informants.

g) The tool was progressively refined based on field based (practical) experience for use in future TIEs.

2 Overview of Sources of Information and Data Collection Procedures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Information</th>
<th>Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National Level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGRP</td>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMO-RALG</td>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALAT</td>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAEU (Management)</td>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Specialists</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development Partners</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary Data</td>
<td>Documentary Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zonal Reform Team</td>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Oversight Group</td>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Trainers</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Councillors</td>
<td>Self Administered Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-do-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Councillors (trained but not re-elected)</td>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Management Team</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Council Link Person</td>
<td>Key Informant Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward/Village Level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward Development Committee, Village Assemblies, CBOs and NGOs</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3 Interview Guide

Note:
The issues were prioritized and customized to each category of informants.

Pre-activity (pre-training) level
1. What are the objectives of the LGRP in Tanzania?
2. What functions are the councillors supposed to perform?
3. What were the gaps in knowledge, skills, attitudes and levels of performance of the councillors before the training was conducted? What was the performance discrepancy? How did it vary between different groups of women and men councillors?
4. How were these gaps and/or performance discrepancy identified? Which groups of women and men were consulted? Was the capacity needs assessment done? By who?
5. How and why was training identified as the most appropriate strategy for bridging the identified performance gaps? What other potential strategies were explored for addressing the identified performance gaps?
6. What results were expected out of the training?

Impact on Participant’s Reaction

Content Issues
7. What were the topics delivered during the training? Were these topics relevant? Were the topics sufficient to address the performance gaps?
8. What was the nature of the training materials used? How were the training materials designed? How were the materials produced? How were the materials distributed? Were the materials appropriate? Were the materials sufficiently used?

Process/Mechanics Issues
9. Who were the facilitators and what sex were they? How were they selected? How were they prepared or oriented to facilitate the training? What was the quality of facilitators in terms of both facilitation skills and knowledge? How was the relationship between the trainers and trainees?
10. What methods were used during the delivery of training? Were the methods appropriate? What were the constraints? How could the methods have been improved?
11. What strategy was adopted during the delivery of the training? Was the adopted strategy appropriate? Were other strategies like hands-on support, exposure visits explored? What challenges were encountered during the use of the adopted strategy?
12. What was the target group for the training and what was the proportion of women and men targeted? Was the target group appropriate? Did you explore possibilities of broadening the target group to include say the council management teams?
13. What was the level of attendance of the trainees? What were the factors affecting the levels of attendance in the respective district councils?
14. How was the delivery of the training monitored? What arrangements were put in place to ensure that the quality of the training is high and consistent? How was backstopping, supervisory support, feedback to
programme planners, corrective actions made during the training process?

**Organisational and Logistical Support**

15. How long did the training last? Was ample time allowed for explanation of concepts, for dialogue between trainers and trainees and between the trainees?

16. When were the training activities conducted? Was the timing of training events appropriate to allow both the acquisition and adoption of the knowledge and skills?

17. What were the considerations made in selecting the venue for the training activities? Were the selected venues appropriate in terms of for instance accessibility, conduciveness for learning and availability of break-away rooms? What were the challenges?

18. What logistics were provided to the participants including stationery, meals, transport, allowances etc…? Were they sufficient? What could have been done better?

19. Did the timing and venue of the training have implications for its accessibility by women and men in the target population?

**Impact on Individual learning:**

20. What were the objectives of the training? Were they clearly written? Were the objectives adequate? Were the objectives achieved? How well were they achieved? Did the male and female trainees feel that the objectives were relevant for them?

21. To what extent were the learning objectives/councillors expectations attained (by gender, geographical location etc…)?

22. Were the councillors targeted actually trained? Were there differences in attendance between men and women?

23. What information, ideas, facts, rules etc. were acquired? - increased knowledge and understanding;

24. What skills were developed or improved (e.g. improved mental, physical and relational skills)?

25. Did the councillors have the will to learn?

**Impact on job behaviour/performance**

26. What attitudes and values have changed in the desired direction?

27. How do you compare the performance of councillors before and after the training?

28. Are there any changes in the performance of councillors as a result of the training? If so, what are these changes? For example are the councillors discharging their representative functions better? Do they demonstrate a heightened awareness of the issues encountered in their agendas/mandates? Are they adhering to leadership ethics and code of conduct? Is there improved working relationship and communication between councillors and the executives?

29. What other factors other than the training may have contributed to the improvement of performance?

30. What factors other than the training may have hindered improvement in performance?

31. Is there a difference in the performance of councillors that were trained and those not trained? If so, which?
32. How are the councillors not re-elected using the skills, knowledge as well as the attitudes and values acquired from the training out of the district councils?

33. What are the benefits of the training beyond the intended results (benefits outside box)?

34. What support is being given to the trained councillors to ensure that they perform and/or use the learned knowledge and skills?

35. Were the trained councillors supported to develop and implement an action plan of how to use the skills and knowledge acquired from the training?

Impact on organisational effectiveness and human settlement capacity building

36. What are the benefits of the training programme to the operation of the LGA?

37. What are the benefits of the training to the LGA management team?

38. How did the training support the LGAs to increase their revenues?

39. Are there skills councillors have tried to impart to other stakeholders in the LGAs?

40. What are the arrangements for sustaining the benefits of the training?

41. Are there cases where the constituents complement the improved performance of the councillors? Or complain about the performance of councillors?

42. What is the percentage of councillors that were re-elected (by gender and by geographical location)? Can this be associated with the training?

2.3 Self Administered Questionnaire with Councillors

a) English Version

Note:
The self administered questionnaire was filled by all the trained councillors in the sampled district councils. To ensure high return rate, the questionnaires were filled when the team visited the district councils before the FGDs (in a classroom arrangement). This required the consultants to explain the purpose of the TIE, the content of the questionnaire and for the participants to ask for any clarifications. The questionnaire was translated to Kiswahili (see b).

Bio Data

Name: ____________________________________________________________

Sex: _____________________________________________________________

Ward and District: ________________________________________________

Position on the Council: ___________________________________________

Political Affiliation: ______________________________________________

60
Level of Education:  


Previous Training/  
Exposure:  


Impact on Participant’s Reaction

1. The objectives of the training matched your expectations and performance gaps.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

2. The topics of the training were relevant and sufficient to address your needs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

3. The training materials were well designed and appropriate in terms of being easy to understand and being comprehensive.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

4. The facilitators who delivered the training were good, providing opportunities for interaction and explaining the concepts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

5. The methods used to deliver the training were appropriate conducive for adult learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

6. The training strategy adopted (residential and distant learning) was appropriate for the adult learners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

7. The target group for the training was appropriate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

8. The level of attendance and participation in the training was good.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
9. The training was well monitored and quality ensured.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

10. The duration of the training was adequate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

11. The timing of the training activities was suitable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

12. The venue for the training was conducive for adult learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

13. The logistics (like stationery, meals, transport, allowances etc…) provided to the participants were sufficient

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree (1)</th>
<th>Disagree (2) Uncertain (3)</th>
<th>Agree (4)</th>
<th>Strongly Agree (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Impact on Individual learning:

14. What were your expectations from the training that were attained?

.................................................................................................................................
.................................................................................................................................

15. What were your expectations from the training that were not attained?

.................................................................................................................................
.................................................................................................................................

16. What information, ideas, facts, rules etc. did you acquire?

.................................................................................................................................
.................................................................................................................................

17. What skills did you develop or improve (mental, physical and relational skills)?

.................................................................................................................................
.................................................................................................................................

18. What attitudes and values have you changed in the desired direction?

.................................................................................................................................
.................................................................................................................................

Impact on job behaviour/performance

19. What changes in your performance can you attribute to the training?

.................................................................................................................................
.................................................................................................................................

20. What other factors other than the training may have contributed to your improvement in performance?

.................................................................................................................................
.................................................................................................................................
Self Administered Questionnaire with Councillors

b) Kiswahili Version

Maelezo Binafisi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jina:</th>
<th>Jinsia:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| Jina la jimbo/ |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wilaya:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| Kamati |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unayowakiisha:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| Shahada/ |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vyeti:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ujuzi:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ujumbe katika chama cha siasa:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Matokeo Ya Kuonyesha Hisia Ya Washiriki

1. Madhumuni ya mafunzo yamelingana na matarajio na kutimiza utendaji.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataa kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

2. Mada za mafunzo zilihusika na kutosha kujishughulisha na mahitaji yako.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataa kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

3. Vifaa vya mafunzo viliundwa vizuri na kufaa.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataa kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

4.Wasaidizi waliofundishwa walikuwa wazuri.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataa kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

5. Mbinu za mafunzo zilifaa.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataa kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

6. Mkakati wa mafunzo uliotumiwa ulifaa.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataa kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataya kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataya kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataya kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

10. Muda wa mafunzo ulitosha.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataya kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

11. Muda wa mafunzo haukutosha na hakufaa.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataya kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

12. Mahali pa mafunzo palifaa kwa masomo ya gumbaru.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataya kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

13. Utaratibu (kama vifaa vya kuandikia, chakula, usafirishaji, marupurupu n.k.) uliowekwa kwa washirika ulitosha.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nakataya kabisa (1)</th>
<th>Sikubali (2)</th>
<th>Sina uhakika (3)</th>
<th>Nakubali (4)</th>
<th>Nakubali kabisa (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Matokeo Ya Kujifunza Kibinafsi**

14. Ni matarajio gani yalitimizwa kwa mafunzo?

15. Ni matarajio gani yasiyotimizwa kutokea na mafunzo?

16. Ni maarifa, vitendo na masharti gani ulijipatia?

17. Ni ujuzi gani ulipata au kuendeleza (kimawazo, kwa vitendo na kihusiana)?

18. Ni mambo gani ambayo umeyafanya kuleta mabadiliko kutokea na mafunzo uliyopewa?

**Matokeo Ya Mwenendo/Utendaji Kazini**

19. Ni mabadiliko gani unaweza kutaja kama matokeo ya mafunzo?

20. Ni vipengele gani mbali na mafunzo ambavyo vimeendeleza utendaji wako?
Training Impact Evaluation
of the Tanzania National Programme for Councillors Training

May 2006